

THE SYMBOLISM OF THE APPLE IN GREEK AND ROMAN LITERATURE

A. R. LITTLEWOOD

IN the year 1899 B. O. Foster published in these *Studies* an article entitled *Notes on the Symbolism of the Apple in Classical Antiquity*, in which he diligently traces the connection of the fruit with Aphrodite, and expresses the hope that he has made "a complete collection of the allusions to the thing in literature." Since his successors (see *Bibliography*, pp. 177ff), dealing with specific aspects of the symbolism, have adduced few further instances, Foster's article has consequently remained the standard work.

I have recently been working on some progymnasmata by Ioannes Geometres that treat of the apple,¹ and I was thus led to put together my own collection of references that I now offer as an *index locorum* of this subject. Making a wider cast I have fished also in Byzantine waters with a mesh fine enough, I hope, to catch most specimens of interest.

Because this article is in the nature of an appendix to Foster's, the notes are intended merely to supplement his, not to provide a comprehensive commentary. All his references, however, are included, being indicated by an asterisk (*).

N.B. "Apple" (μήλον) is used throughout as a generic term to cover the apricot (Ἀρμενικόν), quince (Κυδώνιον), citron (Μηδικόν), peach

¹ Ioannes Geometres, a Byzantine writer of the tenth century with a not inconsiderable reputation for his poetry, wrote four encomia, one on the oak and three on the apple, that are preserved (with two descriptions of his garden) in *Cod. Baroccianus* 25, foll. 287^r-295^r in the Bodleian Library. The first of the three pieces in praise of the apple occurs also in a ms. at Madrid (*Ms. griego* 4614, foll. 22^v-24^v) in the hand of Constantinos Lascaris: this was published in 1769 by J. Iriarte (*Regiae Bibliothecae Matritensis Codices Graeci*, pp. 301ff), but is more easily accessible in Migne, *PG* 106.847ff, although it has been completely overlooked by all writers on the apple. A glance at this article will show Geometres' importance for this study: we owe to his first encomium a myth otherwise unknown, and to his other two some aspects of the symbolism of the fruit rare or unique. Since my projected edition of his progymnasmata is not yet ready for publication, all references are to the folio and line numbers of the Barocci ms.

(Περσικόν), and most other fruits, except nuts, in addition to the genuine apple.

ORIGIN

(i) Gift at the Nuptials of Zeus and Hera:

Pherecyd. frag. 33 (Mueller, *FHG* 1. pp. 78f) apud Schol. in
A.R. 4.1396 et al.

*Eratosth. *Cat.* 3.

*Asclep. Mend. frag. 1 (Mueller, *FHG* 3. p. 306) apud Athen.
3.83C.

Apollod. 2.5.11.

Tzetz. *Chil.* 2.355ff.

Pediasim. 28f.

*Hyg. *Astr.* 2.3.

Schol. in Caes. Germ. *Aratea* (Eyssenhardt, *Martianus Capella*,
pp. 382f).

*Serv. Auct. in Verg. *Aen.* 4.484.

Prim. Myth. Vat. 106 (Bode, *Scriptores Rerum Mythicarum*
Latini, 1. p. 34).

Sec. Myth. Vat. 161 (Bode, 1. p. 130).

In Pediasimus and Tzetzes, contrary to the usual tradition, it is not Ge who presents the apples, but Hera to Zeus, and, perhaps,² Zeus to Hera respectively.

(ii) Created by Dionysus:

Neoptol. Par. frag. 1 (Powell) apud Athen. 3.82D (q.v.).
(See xxi below.)

(iii) Metamorphosis of Melus:

*Serv. Auct. in Verg. *Ecl.* 8.37.

*Melus quidam, in Delo insula ortus, relicta patria fugit ad insulam
Cyprum, in qua eo tempore Cinyras regnabat, habens filium Adonem. hic
Melus sociatum Adoni filio iussit esse, cumque eum videret esse indolis
bonae, propinquam suam, dicatam et ipsam Veneri, quae Pelia dicebatur,
Melo coniunxit. ex quibus nascitur Melus, quem Venus propterea quod
Adonis amore teneretur, tamquam amati filium inter aras praecepit nutriri.*

² The lines in question are (358f), *Ἡρας τὰ μῆλα τὰ χρυσᾶ, Ζεὺς ἄπερ γάμοις ἔσχε | ἐπὶ τῆς *Ἡρας γαμικὸν κάλλιστον ἔδνον εἶναι. Kiessling, rightly suspecting ἐπί, suggests παρά, an attractive emendation despite the difficulty of the meaning of ἔδνον.

sed postquam Adonis apri ictu extinctus est, senex Melus cum dolorem mortis Adonis ferre non posset, laqueo se ad arborem suspendens vitam finit: ex cuius nomine melus appellata est. Peliā autem coniux eius in ea arbore se adpendens necata est. Venus misericordia eorum mortis ducta, Adoni luctum continuum praestitit, Melum in pomum sui nominis vertit, Peliā coniugem eius in columbam mutavit, Melum autem puerum, qui de Cinyrae genere solus supererat, cum adultum vidisset, collecta manu redire ad Delum praecepit. qui cum ad insulam pervenisset et rerum ibi esset potitus, Melon condidit civitatem: et cum primus oves tonderi et vestem de lanis fieri instituisset, meruit ut eius nomine oves μήλα vocarentur; graece enim oves μήλα appellantur.

Although the apple is here connected with Aphrodite, the myth is clearly etymological and of little symbolic importance.

(iv) Metamorphosis of a Maiden:

Geom. 291^v 34ff.

εἰ δὲ δεῖ καὶ μῦθον μνησθῆναι, καὶ οὐδὲν ἀγῆδες παιδίας καὶ ψυχαγωγίας ἄψασθαι πρὸς ἄνδρα πολλάκις καὶ αὐτὸν τὰ Μουσῶν χορεύσαντα, ἄλλως θ' ὅτε καὶ τὸν μῦθον κοσμεῖ σωφροσύνη. φασὶν ὡς κόρη τις ἦν πάλαι καλή καὶ παρθενική, τοῦ δὲ κάλλους ἔρασταὶ πολλοὶ καὶ ἔρωτικοί. σωφρονούσα δὲ καὶ μὴ προδιδοῦσα τὴν ὄραν ἔτι μᾶλλον δυσέρωτας ἐποίει τοὺς ἔραστὰς· οἱ δὲ τέως μὲν ἦρων ὡς ἔρασταὶ καὶ ἡμιλλῶντο πρὸς ἀλλήλους, ἔπειτα οἰνωθέντες ἀλλήλους φονεύουσιν ὡς ἀντερασταί. ἐφίσταται ἡ παρθενική καὶ ἔλεει μὲν ἐκείνους, αἰδεῖται δὲ τοὺς ζῶντας, δακρύει δὲ ἑαυτήν· καὶ γίνεται δι' εὐχῆς φυτὸν, καλὸν ὡς καλή, λευκὸν ὡς λευκή, ὡς αἰδουμένη δὲ πορφυροῦν. The context is an encomium on the apple.

EROTIC SYMBOLISM

(v) Apple of Discord and Judgement of Paris:³

(a) Apple of Discord and Judgement of Paris combined:

Apollod. *Ep.* 3.1f.

*Luc. *Dial. Mar.* 5.

³ These related myths are rationalized by Fulgentius (2.1: 3.7) and the Second Vatican Mythographer (from whom the citations are made). They say that since a union of Jupiter (fire) with Thetis (water) would have extinguished the former, Thetis was joined in marriage with Peleus (πηλός), because *terram aqua mixtam volunt hominem procreasse*. Different gods contributed various gifts to the union, *Discordia autem sola in coniunctione aquae et terrae . . . non intromittitur. Discordia aureum malum, id est cupiditatem, dicitur iniicisse: nam in aureo malo est quod*

- *Philostr. *Ep.* 62 (Kayser).
- Sallust. *De Diis et Mundo* 4.
- *Coluth. 59ff.
- Tzetz. in Lyc. 93.
- Niket. Choniat. (Bonn, p. 856).
- Ioann. Eugen. *Reg. in Parad.* (Boissonade, *Anecd. Nov.* p. 344).
- *Hyg. *Fab.* 92.
- Fulgent. 3.7.
- Prim. Myth. Vat. 208 (Bode, I. pp. 65f).
- Sec. Myth. Vat. 205f (Bode, I. pp. 142ff).
- Tert. Myth. Vat. II. 20ff (Bode, I. pp. 240f).
- Guido de Columnis *Hist. Destruct. Troiae* (Griffin, p. 62).

(b) Apple of Discord alone:

- *Luc. *Symp.* 35.
- Justin. 12.15.⁴
- **Anth. Lat.* I.135 (I.140).⁵

(c) Judgement of Paris alone:

- *Schol. in Eur. *Andr.* 276.
- Luc. *Dial. Deor.* 20.
- Clem. Al. *Protr.* 2.32.9.
- Long. 3.34.
- Aristaenet. I.1.
- *Damoch. (*Anth. Pal.* 9.633).
- Anth. Pal.* 9.637.
- Ioann. Malal. (Bonn, p. 92).
- Geom. 293^v 3ff.
- *Apul. *Met.* 10.30ff.
- *Serv. Auct. in Verg. *Aen.* 1.27.
- Symphosius *Aenigm.* 84 (*Anth. Lat.* I.286 [I.242]).

videas, non quod comedas. This is then linked thus to the Judgement of Paris: *tripartitum autem humanitatis, id est theoricarum, practicarum, philargicarum, modum considerantes poetae, proponunt certamina trium dearum, de formae qualitate certantium. Minerva enim theoreticam, id est contemplativam; Juno practicam, id est activam; Venus philargicam, id est voluptariam designat.* Since Jupiter did not dare to venture a decision between them, he delegated his duty to a mortal, who by giving the apple to Venus chose *libido*.

⁴ Alexander the Great's refusal to name his successor is likened to the Apple of Discord, *hac voce veluti bellicum inter amicos cecinisset, aut malum discordiae misisset, ita omnes in aemulationem consurgunt, et ambitione vulgi tacitum favorem militum quaerunt.* For a further figurative use, see Lucian *Symp.* 35.

⁵ All references to the *Anthologia Latina* are to the volume and poem numbers followed by the fascicle and page numbers in parentheses of Buecheler's and Riese's second edition.

**Anth. Lat.* 1.133f (1.139):*1.165f (1.149): 1.863^a (2.313f).
PLM (Baehrens) 5.77.8iff.

Despite the dearth of early literary evidence, this legend is one of the oldest attested themes in this study, since the crucial scene is depicted by a relief on an ivory comb found in the sanctuary of Artemis Orthia at Sparta and dated from its presence among Proto-Corinthian pottery to c. 700 B.C.⁶ It shows a bearded man seated on a low throne and holding out with an elongated left arm a large, spotted sphere to three female figures, who may be identified by their accoutrements or accompanying birds as Aphrodite, Athene, and Hera.⁷

(vi) Achilles and Briseïs:⁸

**Hes. frag.* 85 (Rzach) apud Schol. Ven. A. in *Hom. Il.* 6.35.
Anth. Lat. 1.135 (1.140).

According to this story (quoted by Foster, p. 50), when the Greeks were about to raise the siege of a town in the vicinity of Troy, a maiden threw an apple to Achilles bearing the message that through lack of water the town could not hold out for long and, presumably, the implication that a private surrender also was greatly desired. The scholiast does not mention the maiden's name, but his comment on the town, τὴν πάλαι μὲν Μονηρίαν, νῦν δὲ Πήδασον καλουμένην, enables the identification to be made, for on a lament of Achilles over the loss of Briseïs whom he had won by sacking a city (*Hom. Il.* 16.57) Schol. T.

⁶ "So far as we know, the apple in this story is, as I have said, a late invention. It is so familiar a tale, that we can hardly realize that the classic poets of Greece did not know it at all, but this seems to be the truth" (Foster, *HSCP* 10[1899] 44). Despite the discovery that this aspect of the story is in fact early, if not widespread, Foster's caution is seasonable.

⁷ For a description and drawing of the comb, see p. 223 and pl. CXXVII of *The Sanctuary of Artemis Orthia at Sparta*, edited by R. M. Dawkins (*JHS*, Supplementary Paper no. 5, London 1929). A photograph can be found on pl. X of *JHS* 68 (1948).

⁸ The scholiast on Homer ascribes this story Δημητρίῳ καὶ Ἡσιόδῳ, but I have reservations about the second name chiefly for the subjective reason that to me such a tale does not sound "Hesiodic" (this is a dangerous argument: before 1913 it would not have seemed outrageous with reference to the apples that lured Atalanta from her path [see n. 11]), but also because it is strange that Hesiod is not mentioned first. Dilthey (*De Callimachi Cydippa*, p. 113) thinks that there is an allusion to this story in Philostratus (*Ep.* 62, Kayser), where the writer sends his mistress not the Apple of Discord, but one of Love, and begs her not to throw it away or eat it, for οὐδὲ ἐν πολέμῳ πρεσβευτῆς παρανομεῖται. I find the allusion unlikely.

has πόλιν εὐτείχεα πέρσας] τὴν Πήδασον οἱ τῶν Κυπρίων ποιηταί, αὐτὸς δὲ Λυρησσόν (e.g. *Il.* 2.690).⁹ Corroborative evidence is afforded by a distich on the apple in the *Codex Salmasianus*,

*His contempta deum tenuit Discordia mensam,
prodidit atque urbem his Briseïda suam.*¹⁰

(vii) Atalanta and Hippomenes or Melanion:¹¹

Hes. frag. 21(b) (Rzach, pp. 269ff).

*Diodorus, apud Schol. in Theoc. 2.120 (vid. Call. frag. 412 [Pfeiffer]).

*Philet. frag. 18 (Powell) apud Schol. in Theoc. 2.120.

*Theoc. 3.40ff et Schol. ad loc.

Apollod. 3.9.2.

Plut. *Prov.* 44 (Crusius, p. 21).

Diogenian. 3.63.

Lib. 8.54 (Foerster).

Nonn. *D.* 12.87ff.

*Arab. (*Anth. Plan.* 144).

Tzetz. *Chil.* 12.934ff.

Apostol. 4.87.

Catull. 2b.

Verg. *Cat.* 9.25f; *Ecl.* 6.61 et Serv., Iun. Philarg., Prob. ad loc.

Hyg. *Fab.* 185.

Ov. *Her.* 21.123f; **Met.* 10.560ff; *Ib.* 371f et Scholl. ad loc.

Claud. 30.169f.

Lact. Plac. *Arg. Ov. Met.* 10.11.

*Serv. in Verg. *Aen.* 3.113.

Sid. Apoll. *Carm.* 2.494ff; 5.167ff; 14.13ff.

Priap. 16 (Cazzaniga).

Prim. Myth. Vat. 39 (Bode, I. p. 14).

Sec. Myth. Vat. 47 (Bode, I. p. 91).

Anth. Lat. 1.133 (1.139): 1.169 (1.150): 2.343 (1.164).

The apples that distract Atalanta may be a later accretion to a very early legend of exogamy, beena marriage, and female kinship, unless

⁹ Could Monenia hide an adjective formed from Mynes, whom we know to have been king of Lyrnessus (Hom. *Il.* 2.691f; 19.295f)?

¹⁰ Foster refers (p. 44) to this distich in a footnote to the Apple of Discord, but inexplicably ignores it in this connection.

¹¹ Foster describes in detail (p. 42) a Greek *crater* of the mid-fifth century that used to be the only evidence for the existence of apples in the myth before Alexandrian authors. The welcome find of a papyrus has now established the literary antiquity of the apples, that are not mentioned in the fragments of the "Hesiodic" corpus known before.

their mythological function here is a survival of their fructifying ritual use (see xii and pp. 18of below).

(viii) Acontius and Cydippe:

Dieg. ad Call. *Aet.* 3 frag. 67 (Pfeiffer).

Aristaenet. 1.10.

Max. Plan. *Metaphr. Ov. Her.* 2of (Dilthey, *De Callimachi Cydippa*, pp. 157ff).

*Ov. *Her.* 2of: *A.A.* 1.457f: *Tr.* 3.10.73f.

Priap. 16 (Cazzaniga).

(ix) Hermochares and Ctesylla:

Nic. frag. 50 (Schneider) apud Athen. 3.82A.¹²

*Anton. Lib. 1.

This is basically the same story as viii with a change of names.

(x) Gift as Symbol of Affection:¹³

Clearch. frag. 39 (Mueller, *FHG* 2. pp. 315f) apud Athen. 12.553Eff.

*Theoc. 2.120: * 3.10f: * 11.10.

*Luc. *Tox.* 13: 15.

*Philostr. *Ep.* 62 (Kayser).

Long. 1.15: * 3.25: * 3.33f.

*Alciphr. 3.26.2 (Schepers).

*Nonn. *D.* 42.312ff.

*Paul. Silent. (*Anth. Pal.* 5.29of).

**Anth. Pal.* 11.417.

Geom. 292^r 17ff.

Niket. Choniat. (Bonn, p. 192).

*Catull. 65.19ff.

*Verg. *Ecl.* 2.51: * 3.7of.¹⁴

¹² The only two lines preserved are, ἀντίχ' ὄγ' ἡ Σιδόεντος ἢ Ἐλλείστου ἀπὸ κήπων / μῆλα ταμῶν χροάοντα τύπους ἐνεμάσσετο Κάδμου. Their attribution to the tale of Hermochares and Ctesylla rests upon the mention of writing on an apple, and the heading to the version of Antoninus Liberalis, Ἰστορεῖ Νικανδρος Ἐτρεοιουμένων γ'.

¹³ Cf. *Lucr. 5.963ff, *conciliabat enim vel mutua quamque cupido / vel violenta viri vis atque impensa libido / vel pretium, glandes atque arbiter pira lecta* (from the description of primitive man).

¹⁴ Iunius Philargyrius (ad loc.: cf. id. in *Ecl.* 2.51) believes that the ten apples symbolize the ten eclogues, a notion that Servius (ad loc.) rightly treats with disdain, *quod superfluum est: quae enim necessitas hoc loco allegoriae?*

Hor. *Ep.* 1.1.77f.

*Prop. 1.3.24ff: 2.34.69ff: * 3.13.27.

*Petr. (*Anth. Lat.* 1.218 [1.185]).

*Mart. 7.91.

Alcimius (*Anth. Lat.* 1.715 [2.178]).

A famous historical example of this is
The Disgrace of Eudokia:

Theophan. *Chron.* (Bonn, p. 153).

Kedren. (Bonn, pp. 590f).

Zonar. (Bonn, 3. p. 110).

Mich. Glyk. (Bonn, p. 484).

Chron. Pasch. (Bonn, 1. p. 584).

Theodosios II (408–450) bought at great expense a magnificent apple, and gave it to his wife Eudokia Augusta as a token of his affection. She sent it as a gift to the sickbed of Paulinos, a close friend of the imperial pair and, as scandal reported, her lover: he unfortunately deemed it a present worthy of his Emperor. In the ensuing confrontation between husband and wife, Eudokia imprudently claimed that she had eaten the apple, when challenged to produce it by her lord, who thereupon added to her discomfort by banishing Paulinos to Cappadocia, where he was put to death. Unable to dispel Theodosios' distrust and wrath, which his elder sister Pulcheria jealously encouraged, Eudokia eventually obtained permission to retire to Jerusalem, where she, the quondam Athenais, pagan daughter of a Greek philosopher, died eighteen years later, a Christian mystic renowned for her pious works. Despite Gibbon's derisive dismissal of the tale "as fit only for the Arabian Nights," it is not necessarily implausible.

(xi) Throwing of an Apple as Symbol of Affection:¹⁵

*Ar. *Nub.* 997 et * Schol. ad loc.

*Plat. (*Anth. Pal.* 5.78f).

*Theoc. 5.88f: * 6.6f et * Scholl. ad locc.

¹⁵ The word *μηλοβολεῖν* is attested by a scholiast on Aristophanes *Nub.* 997. Usually the boy throws an apple at the girl. In Theocritus, however, Clearista pelts a goatherd, and Galatea Polyphemus (wherein Vergil and Niketas Eugenianos follow the Alexandrian poet): Daphnis and Chloë throw apples to each other in Longus: Philostratus describes two *Ἐρωτες* kissing an apple which they toss back and forth: Lucian adds the refinement of biting a piece out of an apple to cast into the bosom of the girl, a game that is imitated very closely by Aristaenetus (for both Lucian [*Tox.* 13] and Alciphron [3.26.2, Schepers] *στέφανοι ἡμιμάραντοι καὶ μῆλά τινα ἀποδεδηγμένα* are a lover's gifts).

- Plut. *Prov.* 44 (Crusius, p. 21).
 Diogenian. 3.63: 6.63: *Cod. Vind.* 3.27.
 *Luc. *Dial. Mer.* 12.1.
 *Philostr. *Imagg.* 1.6.
 Heliod. 3.3.8.
 *Long. 1.24.
 *Aristaenet. 1.25.
 *Hesych. s.v. μήλω βαλεῖν.
 Phot. s.v. μήλω βαλεῖν.
 *Suda, s.v. βάλλειν μήλοις: μήλοις βάλλειν: μήλω βληθῆναι.
 Geom. 292^r 19ff.
 Niket. Eugenian. 6.463ff.
 Eustath. 1572.48f (in Hom. *Od.* 7.115).
 Mich. Akominat. (Lambros, 2. p. 18).
 Niket. Choniati. (Bonn, p. 857).
 Greg. Cypr. 1.72 (*Cod. Leid.*).
 Apostol. 4.87.
 *Verg. *Ecl.* 3.64.¹⁶
 Ov. *Her.* 20.9f.
Epig. Bobiens. 32.

(xii) Relating to Marriage:

- *Stesich. frag. 10 (Page) apud Athen. 3.81D.
 *Sapph. frag. 105 (Lobel et Page) apud Syrian. in Hermog. π. ἰδ. α̅
 (Rabe, 1. p. 15), et Schol. in Theoc. 11.38f.
 Strab. 15.3.17.
 *Plut. *Con. Praec.* 1 (*Mor.* 138D): * *Quaest. Rom.* 65 (*Mor.* 279F):
Sol. 20.4.
 Long. 1.19.
 Nonn. *D.* 13.351ff.
 *Arab. (*Anth. Plan.* 144).

Stesichorus relates that at the marriage of Menelaus and Helen quinces were thrown at the chariot, a custom that originally was perhaps believed to encourage fecundity through sympathetic magic. When such a belief had been eradicated in the course of religious evolution, the custom could be extended to courting, as in xi above, where the fruit would appear to be symbolic of love generally.

The other instances under this heading are of widely differing

¹⁶ On *malo* Philargyrius (ad loc.) gives the fatuous interpretation *idest omni hora*.

importance: Sappho compares a bride¹⁷ to an apple blushing on a tree-top out of the pickers' reach: Strabo gives the information that amongst the Persians a girl on her wedding day was allowed to eat nothing but apples and a camel's marrow: Solon decreed, according to Plutarch, that on the night of their marriage the husband should give his wife a quince to eat to ensure that thereafter all her words to him would be as sweet:¹⁸ Longus makes Dorco, yearning for Chloë as his wife, propose *inter alia* fifty apple trees as payment to her father (I doubt that any symbolism is intended here, despite Longus' predilection for it): at the nuptials of Cadmus and Harmonia, as Nonnus would have us believe, Aphrodite and the Loves hung about the bridal chamber golden fruit brought by the nymphs of the Hesperides from their garden as *νύμφης ἔδνον ἔρωτος ἐπάξιον*, leaves of which the enamoured pair entwined in their hair in place of the traditional roses: Arabius Scholasticus considers that the apples which Hippomenes threw near Atalanta were not only a device whereby he could win the race, but also a wedding present, being *ζυγίης σύμβολον Παφίης*.

The Byzantine historians again give an example: Theophilus' Choice of Bride:¹⁹

Georg. Hamart. (Muralt, p. 700).

Sym. Mag. (Bonn, pp. 624f).

Leo Gramm. (Bonn, pp. 213f).

Zonar. (Bonn, 3. pp. 401f).

Mich. Glyk. (Bonn, pp. 535f).

Theodos. Melit. (Tafel, p. 177).

Chron. Pop. (Psichari, "Cassia et la pomme d'or," *Annuaire de l'École pratique* 1910/1911, pp. 24ff).

Chron. Pop. (Polites, "Κασσία," *Laographia* 6 [1917] 359ff).

Euphrosyne, the stepmother of the Emperor Theophilus (829–842), gathered together in the palace many beautiful maidens so that he could choose his wife, a custom said to have been observed also by Michael III

¹⁷ The information that the girl is a bride we owe to Himerius (*Or.* 9.16, Colonna), whose explanation of the passage is quoted by Foster (p. 47 n. 2). Sappho's picture may be the inspiration behind Herodas' statue (4.27ff) and Longus' description (3.33f) of the lovely apple that Daphnis picked from the top of the tree for Chloë.

¹⁸ See, however, E. S. McCartney, "How the Apple Became the Token of Love," *TAPA* 56 (1925) 81 n. 77.

¹⁹ The chronological difficulties of this tale, derived from Simeon the Logothete, have been adequately expressed by E. W. Brooks ("The Marriage of the Emperor Theophilus," *BZ* 10 [1901] 540ff).

and Leo VI and, at the Russian court, by Ivan IV ("The Terrible").²⁰ In this instance alone the Emperor held a golden apple which he was to give to the favoured damsel. Although he was greatly attracted by one Eikasia, he said to her, (Leo Gramm.) διὰ γυναικὸς ἔρρηή τὰ φαῦλα, but her pert reply, ἀλλὰ διὰ γυναικὸς πηγάζει τὰ κρείττονα,²¹ so put him aback that he turned aside and proffered the apple to Theodora the Paphlagonian.

(xiii) Symbolizing a Woman's Breasts:

- *Crat. frag. 40 (Kock, *CAF* 1. p. 142) apud Athen. 2.50E et Eustath. 1633.56f (in Hom. *Od.* 9.359).
- *Canth. frag. 6 (Kock, *CAF* 1. p. 765) apud Athen. 3.81D.
- *Ar. *Ach.* 1199: * *Eccl.* 903: * *Lys.* 155 et * Scholl. ad locc.
- *Theoc. 27.49f.
- *Leon. Tar. (*Anth. Pal.* 6.211: * *Anth. Plan.* 182).
Aristaenet. 1.1: 1.3.
Nonn. *D.* 35.33f.
Paul. Silent. (*Anth. Pal.* 5.258: * 290f).
- *Rufin. (*Anth. Pal.* 5.60).
- **Anth. Pal.* 11.417.
Suda, s.v. μῆλα.
Niket. Eugen. 4.276.
Auct. *Carm. ad Lydiam*, 18 (Wernsdorf, *PLM* 3. p. 400).

Here, where Leonidas of Tarentum coins the word *μηλοῦχος* (*strophium*), there is a combination of erotic symbolism and similarity of shape: for other aspects of the latter see xxxvi–xxxix and xlv–li.

(xiv) Game with Pips:²²

- Poll. 9.128
- *Hor. *Serm.* 2.3.272f et Acr., * Porph., Schol. ad loc.

²⁰ "He (Ivan) made an unexpected and apposite quotation from the saints and explained that he had discarded the idea of a foreign match, because mixed marriages did not turn out well. The young ladies of the realm were paraded and John (Ivan) made a wise choice" (B. Pares, *A History of Russia*³ [New York 1937] p. 100). This was Ivan's first marriage: his other seven were less successful. For the continuation of the tradition in Russia until the seventeenth century, see the references given by Brooks (p. 543; above, n. 19).

²¹ Some accounts explain Eikasia's retort as a reference to the Virgin Mary having given birth to Christ, an appropriate thought for a devout young Christian. It is tempting, but completely unjustifiable, to invest both her remarks and Theophilos' with the symbolism of xxviii.

²² Lovers' games of divination by apples are common even today: examples are given in most of the works mentioned in the Bibliography (to these may be added Sir J. G. Frazer, *Balder the Beautiful*, I. pp. 237f).

This game of attempting to hit the ceiling with pips as an augury of success both in love and generally is compared by Pollux with the "cottabos."

(xv) Use of Pips in an Aphrodisiac:²³

P. Griffith-Thompson, col. 15, p. 105.

In this recipe, some details of which are not certain, nine pips from an apple are to be pounded with such potent ingredients as "a little shaving from the head of a man who has died a violent death," "seven grains of barley that has been buried in a grave," the blood of a worm, of a black dog, and of the second finger of your left hand, and some of your semen. When this mixture has been added to a cup of wine, "you make the woman drink it."

(xvi) Miscellaneous Erotic:²⁴

Ibyc. frag. 5 (Page) apud Athen. 13.601B.

Ar. *Lys.* 857f.

Plat. (*Anth. Plan.* 210).

Clearch. frag. 39 (Mueller, *FHG* 2. pp. 315f) apud Athen. 12.553Eff.

Theoc. 7.117: * 11.39: * 14.38 et Scholl. ad locc.

Mosch. 4.56f.

Herod. 4.27ff.

Antig. Caryst. apud Athen. 3.82B.

Archyt. Amphiss. frag. 2 (Powell) aut Euphor. frag. 11 (Powell) apud Athen. 3.82A.

D.S. 4.26.2.

Ael. *H.A.* 9.39.²⁵

²³ See A. Abt, *Die Apologie des Apuleius von Madaura und die antike Zauberei* (Giessen 1908) pp. 317ff.

²⁴ The following verses from *Canticles* are worthy of comparison: "As the apple tree among the trees of the wood, so is my beloved among the sons. I sat down under his shadow with great delight, and his fruit was sweet to my taste" (2.3): "Stay me with flagons, comfort me with apples: for I am sick of love" (2.5): "Thy temples are like a piece of a pomegranate within thy locks" (4.3 = 6.7): "Now also thy breasts shall be as clusters of the vine, and the smell of thy nose like apples" (7.8). Upon the imagined symbolism of these passages Gregory of Nyssa discourses at great length (Jaeger, vol. 6). The apple is used figuratively also in *Proverbs*, "A word fitly spoken is like apples of gold in pictures of silver" (25.11).

²⁵ Aelian tells a tale that even he does not believe: *τίκτει (δέ) τι και η μηλέα και διαφθείρει μεν τουτο πολλακις τον καρπον του φυτου τουδδε, ταις δε ετι του τικτειν εχουσαις ωραν γενονται αν και ες κύησιν αγαθόν. και τον τρόπον ερει άλλος*. The nearest parallel to

- Artemid. 1.73.
 *Philostr. *Imagg.* 1.6: 1.15.3: *Ep.* 27 (Kayser).
 Long. 1.23.
 Metrod. (*Anth. Pal.* 14.117).
 Lib. 8.275f (Foerster).
 Alciph. 4.13.15 (Scheppers).
 Aristaenet. 1.12.
 Geom. 292ff.
Dig. Akrit. 7.1991 (*Cod. Treb.*).
 Theodor. Prodrum. 6.298ff.
 Ioann. Eugen. *Reg. in Parad.* (Boissonade, *Anecd. Nov.* p. 346).
 Plaut. *Amphit.* 723f (cf. n. 25).
 Tib. 3.4.30ff.
 Ov. *Met.* 3.482ff: 4.329ff.
 Florus (*Anth. Lat.* 1.248 [1.201]).²⁶
Priap. 38: 58 (Cazzaniga).
 Sid. Apoll. *Carm.* 11.67.²⁷

CONNECTED WITH GODS AND HEROES

(xvii) With Aphrodite:

- *Paus. 2.10.5.
 *Hesych. s.v. 'Ραμνονσία Νέμεσις.
 *Phot. s.v. 'Ραμνονσία Νέμεσις.
 *Suda, s.v. 'Ραμνονσία Νέμεσις.

References here are too numerous to warrant inclusion, but note particularly those above (Pausanias says that Canachus' statue of

this that I can find anywhere is the fact gleaned by Frazer (*The Magic Art*, 2. p. 57, quoted by Foster, p. 39) that "among the Kara-Kirghiz barren women roll themselves on the ground under a solitary apple-tree in order to obtain offspring." In Greek and Roman literature we find only that an apple may afford slight relief to a woman in travail (Sor. *Gyn.* 4.7.6: cf. Plaut. *Amphit.* 723f).

²⁶ *Quando ponebam novellas arbores mali et piri,
 cortici summae notavi nomen ardoris mei.
 nulla fuit exinde finis vel quies cupidinis:
 crescit arbor, gliscit ardor: animus implet litteras.*

This rather pleasant little poem is, I believe, the only instance in classical literature of the apple tree being chosen for this purpose.

²⁷ In an epithalamium Cupid reports to his mother that he has inflamed Ruricius, for whom various heroines of mythology would have given their most prized possessions or most famous attributes (e.g. Ariadne the thread for the labyrinth, Alcestis her life, Atalanta her feet). Amongst these appears Calypso with her *poma*. I take the meaning to be no more than that the goddess would have been willing to give Ruricius her lovely home on Ogygia: any erotic symbolism, although possible, is doubtful.

Aphrodite at Sicyon held a poppy in one hand and an apple in the other, the lexicographers agree that the Rhamnusia Nemesis, modelled on Aphrodite, held an apple bough). The confusion of contradictory accounts that mysteriously enshrouds the discovery of the "Venus de Milo" is notorious, but it is worth remarking that according to some the statue originally held an apple in one hand (authorities differ over which).²⁸

(xviii) With Apollo:²⁹

Hellanic. frag. 117 (Mueller, *FHG* 1. p. 60) apud Steph. Byz. sub *Μαλόεις*.

Thuc. 3.3.3 et Schol. ad loc.

Mnesith. Ath. apud Athen. 3.80E.

Call. frag. 485 (Pfeiffer) apud Choerob. *In Theod.* 3 (Hilgard, 1. p. 152.13ff).

Luc. *Anach.* 9.

Inscr. Gr. ins. 2.484.18ff.

Hesych. s.v. *Μαλ[λ]όεις*.

Geom. 291^r 16ff.

The cult of Apollo *Μαλόεις* is explained by an aetiological myth mentioned by Hellanicus, and preserved more fully in the Patmian scholia on Thucydides: *Μαλόεις Ἀπόλλων. οὔτος παρὰ Μιτυληναίους ἐτιμᾶτο, ἀπὸ τοιαύτης δέ τινος αἰτίας. Μαντῶ ἢ Τειρεσίου θυγάτηρ περὶ τοὺς τόπους χορεύουσα τούτους, μῆλον χρυσοῦν ἀπὸ τοῦ περιδεραίου ἀπώλεσεν. εὔξατο οὖν, εἰ εὔροι, ἱερὸν ἰδρύσειν τῷ θεῷ. εὔρουσα δὲ τὸ μῆλον, τὸ ἱερὸν ἰδρύσατο, καὶ Μαλόεις Ἀπόλλων ἐντεῦθεν παρ' αὐτοῖς ἐτιμᾶτο.* Geometres says that while other trees were attributed to Aphrodite or Dionysus, the apple, palm, and bay alone were consecrated to Apollo. His belief may be founded merely on the use of the apple as a prize at the Pythian Games (see xxxi b below), a fact of which he was aware.

²⁸ One of the earliest witnesses, and perhaps the most reliable, is the young naval ensign D. d'Urville, who records (*Annales maritimes* [Bajot 1821] p. 150) that he saw the left arm raised and holding an apple. For Aphrodite's cult titles as a goddess of fruits, see Foster (p. 41).

²⁹ The astonishing thesis that Apollo was originally an "apple-deity" has been argued to the satisfaction of some by J. Rendel Harris ("The Origin of the Cult of Apollo," *Bulletin of the John Rylands Library*, January to March 1916). His evidence, both summarized and expanded by A. B. Cook in a lengthy footnote (*Zeus*, 2. pp. 487ff), does not appear convincing to me, since it is usually not hard to find objections to or alternative explanations of his several points.

(xix) With Athene:

Apollod. 2.5.11.
Pediasim. 29.

Apart from frequent reference to the goddess in the Judgement of Paris, she is connected with the fruit in that she conveyed to the Garden of the Hesperides for safekeeping the apples that Heracles had stolen, according to Apollodorus and his imitator.

(xx) With Demeter:

Paus. 1.44.3.

Pausanias tells of a sanctuary in Nisaea of Demeter *Μαλοφόρος*: of the explanations of this title the only one that he thinks fit to mention is that those who first tended sheep in the area called her this. "Apple-bearing" or "fruit-bearing," however, seems a more fitting epithet of Demeter.³⁰

(xxi) With Dionysus:

*Philet. frag. 18 (Powell) apud Schol. in Theoc. 2.120.
*Call. frag. 412 (Pfeiffer) apud Schol. in Theoc. 2.120.
*Theoc. 2.120.
Neoptol. Par. frag. 1 (Powell) apud Athen. 3.82D (q.v.).
*Nonn. *D.* 42.307ff.

The connection of the apple with Dionysus is tenuous: as a god of vegetation he sometimes wore a garland from the tree (Philetas and Callimachus): in Nonnus the god, a lover himself, covertly refers to the fruit's erotic symbolism. There remains the statement of Athenaeus that Dionysus was the *εὐρετής τῶν μήλων*, to prove which he adduces Theocritus, who merely mentions "apples of Dionysus" as a lover's gift, and Neoptolemus of Parium, who does indeed say that the apple's *εὐρετής* was Dionysus but destroys any particular significance by adding *καθ' ἕνα καὶ τῶν ἄλλων ἀκροδρύων*.³¹

(xxii) With Eris or Ares:

Artemid. 1.73.
Lib. 8.274 (bis) (Foerster).

³⁰ See Cook (above, n. 29) 2. pp. 488f.

³¹ For Dionysus as a god of trees in general, see Frazer, *Spirits of the Corn and of the Wild*, 1. pp. 3f.

These references are in addition to the Apple of Discord (see v above) thrown onto the table at the marriage feast of Peleus and Thetis by Eris. Libanius makes the apple sacred to Ares without further comment, and Artemidorus believes that to dream of sour apples, sacred to Eris, bodes quarrels (see xxxiii below).

(xxiii) With Eros:

Plat. (*Anth. Plan.* 210).

Theoc. 7.117.

*Philostr. *Imagg.* 1.6.

Niket. Choniast. (Bonn, p. 857).

Plato describes Eros lying in a shady wood *πορφυρέοις μῆλοισιν ἐοικότα*, and Theocritus in imitation likens *Ἐρωτες* to *μάλοισιν ἐρευθομένοισιν*. Philostratus has an elaborate portrait of *Ἐρωτες* harvesting apples. Some hang their quivers on the branches and fly up to the fruit, others enjoy eating them, two kiss an apple which they throw to each other, an indication that they are falling in love, another is pelted with apples by spectators for biting the ear of his opponent in a wrestling match, others again chase the hare that eats the fallen apples, and finally some gather around Aphrodite with the first fruits of their harvesting. Similarly Niketas mentions sculptured *Ἐρωτες* quivering with sweet laughter as they hurl apples at each other.

(xxiv) With Priapus:³²

Nemesian. *Ecl.* 2.51.

Priap. 16: 38: 42: 53: 6of: 71f (Cazzaniga).

Anth. Lat. 1.885 (2.332).

“Poma” were naturally offered to Priapus to encourage him in his duty of promoting and protecting crops. An image of the god himself could be made of apple wood (*Priap.* 61).

(xxv) With Zeus:

Geom. 293^v 26ff.

Meliteniotes *Paradis.* 1548f.³³

³² Amongst the *apophoreta* produced by Trimalchio at his dinner party we find (Petr. *Sat.* 56) “*serisapia et contumelia*”: *xerophagi ex sapa datae sunt et contus cum malo*. T. Studer (*Gymn. Bernensis Ann. lect.* 1839) sees in the words *contus cum malo*, besides the obvious paronomasia, an ithyphallic significance, but H. D. Rankin (*Rh. Mus.* 107 [1964] 361ff) rightly concludes that he adduces insufficient evidence.

³³ This allegorical poem on Paradise is published in *Notices et extraits des manuscrits de la Bibliothèque Impériale* 19.2 (Paris) pp. 1–138, edited by M. Miller.

Both these authors describe Zeus holding an orb, called an apple, that represents power (on which see xxxix below).

(xxvi) With Heracles:

(a) Apples of the Hesperides:³⁴

Pherecyd. frag. 33 (Mueller, *FHG* 1. pp. 78ff) apud Schol. in A.R. 4.1396 et al.

Schol. in Hes. *Theog.* 215.

Soph. *Trach.* 1099f.

Eur. *H.F.* 394ff.

Schol. in Eur. *Hipp.* 742.

Isoc. *Hel.* 24.

A.R. 4.1396ff.

Eratosth. *Cat.* 3.

D.S. 4.26.2ff.

Iuba, frag. 24 (Mueller, *FHG* 3. p. 472) apud Athen. 3.83Bf.

Agroetas, frag. 3 (Mueller, *FHG* 4. p. 295) apud Schol. in A.R. 4.1396.

Strab. 3.2.13: 4.1.7.

Apollod. 2.5.11.

Palaeph. 18.

Phil. (*Anth. Plan.* 93).

Paus. 2.13.8: 5.11.6: 5.18.4: 6.19.8.

Q.S. 6.256ff.

Nonn. *D.* 25.247f.

³⁴ In mythology the Apples of the Hesperides, most famous for their theft by Heracles, were originally those presented by Ge at the nuptials of Zeus and Hera, but they became common stock for most legends concerning the fruit, and later were used to describe any unusually beautiful specimens. Thus Juvenal could believe that the apples eaten by Virro and his friends were *subrepta sororibus Afris*, whilst to the downtrodden *clientes* was served rotten fruit fit to be gnawed by a performing monkey. I append a list of references to the Apples of the Hesperides, by name or by periphrasis, that contain no mention of their connection with Heracles: it is, I am sure, very incomplete.

Hes. *Theog.* 215f: *ibid.* 333ff: Orph. frag. 34 (Kern, p. 110) apud Clem. Al. *Protr.* 2.17.2ff et Euseb. *Praep. Ev.* 2.3.23: Eur. *Hipp.* 742: Antiph. frag. 58 (Kock, *CAF* 2. pp. 35f) apud Athen. 3.84Af: Eriph. frag. 2 (Kock, *CAF* 2. p. 429) apud Athen. 3.84B: Call. *Cer.* 11: Timachidas et Pamphilus apud Athen. 3.82Df: Aristocrat. frag. 1 (Mueller, *FHG* 4. p. 332) apud Athen. 3.82E: Poll. 6.47: Philostr. *Imagg.* 2.17.6: Nonn. *D.* 13.351ff: Hesych. s.v. Ἑσπερίδων μήλα: Coluth. 59: Heraclit. *Incred.* 20: Verg. *Cat.* 9.25: *id.* *Ecl.* 6.61 et Philarg., Prob. ad loc.: *id.* *Aen.* 4.484f: Hyg. *Fab.* 151: Ov. *Met.* 9.190: *ibid.* 11.114: Scholl. in Ov. *Ib.* 371: Sil. Ital. 3.283ff: *id.* 4.636f: Mart. 10.94.1: *id.* 13.37.2: Juv. 5.152: Claud. 30.177: Serv. in Verg. *Aen.* 3.113: *Priap.* 16: *Anth. Lat.* 1.169 (1.150): *ibid.* 1.885 (2.332): Prim. Myth. Vat. 39 (Bode, 1. p. 14): Sec. Myth. Vat. 114 (Bode, 1. p. 113).

- Epigr. Gr.* 1082.13f (Kaibel).
 Eudok. Aug. *Violar.* 356: 436 (Flach, pp. 277f: 347).
 Christodorus (*Anth. Pal.* 2.25).
Anth. Plan. 92.
 Geom. 293^r 33ff.
 Tzetz. *Chil.* 2.355ff.
 Eustath. 1572.43ff (in Hom. *Od.* 7.115): *Ep.* 1 (Tafel, *Eustath.*
Opusc. p. 308).
 Pediasim. 28f.
 Meliteniotes *Paradis.* 2064ff.
 Apostol. 11.57.
 Varro *R.R.* 2.1.6.
 Lucr. 5.32ff.
 Prop. 2.24.26: 3.22.10.
 Hyg. *Fab.* 30: *Astr.* 2.3.
 Schol. in Caes. Germ. *Aratea* (Eyssenhardt, *Martianus Capella*,
 pp. 382f).
 Ov. *Met.* 4.637ff: *Nux* 111f.
 Sen. *Ag.* 852ff: *H.F.* 239f: 530ff: *H.O.* 18: *Ph.* 316f.
 Luc. 9.357f.
 Sil. Ital. 6.183f.
 Stat. *Silv.* 3.1.158f.
 Mart. 9.101.4.
 Solin. 24.4f.
 Auson. *Ecl.* 25 (Peiper, p. 107).
 Serv. in Verg. *Aen.* 4.484.
 Serv. Auct. in Verg. *Aen.* 4.246: 484: 8.299.
 Fulg. *Verg. Cont.* 739: 755 (Helm, pp. 84: 97).
 Maximian. 1.180f.
 Sid. Apoll. *Carm.* 9.97: 13.12: 15.143.
 Albric. 22.
 Hilasius (*Anth. Lat.* 1.627 [2.95f]).
Anth. Lat. 1.134 (1.139).
 Prim. Myth. Vat. 38: 106 (Bode, 1. pp. 13f: 34).
 Sec. Myth. Vat. 161 (Bode, 1. p. 130).
 Tert. Myth. Vat. 13.5 (Bode, 1. p. 248).

Some ancient writers³⁵ rationalized this difficult myth by making the

³⁵ D.S. 4.26.2f: Agroetas, frag. 3 (Mueller, *FHG* 4. p. 295) apud Schol. in A.R. 4.1396: Palaeph. 18: Apostol. 11.57: Varro *R.R.* 2.1.6: Serv. in Verg. *Aen.* 4.484: Prim. Myth. Vat. 38 (Bode, 1. pp. 13f): Sec. Myth. Vat. 161 (Bode, 1. p. 130): Tert. Myth. Vat. 13.5 (Bode, 1. p. 248). If this explanation were right, the myth could be considered to duplicate that of the stealing of the kine of Geryon, especially since the two labours are often consecutive in accounts, both took place in the far West (the Hesperides are, however, sometimes placed

nymphs of the Hesperides shepherdesses keeping watch over their sheep (μῆλα), an explanation tempting for its simplicity, but almost certainly wrong. For some modern theories see Bibliography iii, vii, ix, and xi.

(b) The Sacrifice of Apples:

Poll. 1.30f.

Zenob. 5.22.

Hesych. s.v. Μῆλων Ἑρακλῆς.

Suda, s.v. Μῆλειος Ἑρακλῆς.

Proverb. Coislinian. 338 (Leutsch et Schneidewin, *Append. Prov.* 3.93, *Corp. Paroem. Graec.* 1. p. 434).

Since the flood waters of the Asopus delayed the arrival of the sacrificial animal (either a sheep or an ox), some children for fun made an animal out of an apple with little sticks for legs and horns. The unwitting Heracles was pleased by this sacrifice, and therefore the rite was continued in this form amongst the Boeotians.³⁶

For further, although tenuous, connections between Heracles and the apple see xxxiv–xxxvi and xxxix below.

(xxvii) With Alexander the Great:

Chares, frag. 4 (Mueller, *SRAM* p. 115) apud Athen. 7.277A.

Dorotheus, frag. 1 (Mueller, *SRAM* p. 155) apud Athen. 7.276F.

Geom. 293^v 23ff.

Eustath. 1572.45ff (in Hom. *Od.* 7.115).

Ioann. Hildersheim, *Hist. Trium Regum* 22. p. 239.³⁷

Alexander and his father were both φιλόμηλοι (Dorotheus and Eustathius), the latter even having apples named after him (Eustathius). Chares records the following curious story (also in Eustathius): κάλλιστα μῆλα εὐρών ὁ Ἀλέξανδρος περὶ τὴν Βαβυλωνίαν χώραν τούτων τε πληρώσας τὰ σκάφη μηλομαχίαν ἀπὸ τῶν νεῶν ἐποίησατο, ὡς τὴν θέαν

among the Hyperboreans), and under μῆλα the lexicographers give πάντα τὰ τετράποδα. Geometres (293^v 22ff) deliberately considers the two words one merely that he can bring in a quotation from Hesiod (*Op.* 161ff) in his comprehensive praise of the fruit. For further etymological confusion, see iii and xxvi b, and, for the allegory of the apples as stars, see xxxvi.

³⁶ A very similar tale is mentioned by Zenobius (5.5) about the Locrians, who sacrificed an “ox” that they had made by inserting sticks into gourds.

³⁷ The references are to the numbers of the chapters and pages of *Three Kings of Cologne*, edited by C. Horstmann (*Early English Text Society*, no. 85, London 1886), where the Latin text of *Ms Brandenburg* 1.1.176 is printed after two English translations. For Alexander’s connection here with the apple, see xxix.

ἡδίστην γενέσθαι, behaviour a little hard to imagine on the part of the historical Alexander. Geometres mentions an apple representing dominion (for which see xxxix below) in the hand of *Μηλοφόρος Ἀλέξανδρος*, but whether this is a painting by Apelles or a statue by Lysippus he does not know.

(xxviii) With the Virgin Mary:

The origins of the "Virgin with Apple," a not uncommon mediaeval motif, probably go back to the Greek prototypes such as the statue of Aphrodite at Sicyon mentioned by Pausanias (2.10.5). To this, however, Christians added their own symbolism, for, just as Eve touched the forbidden fruit, so Mary bore a better fruit, as is shown by the hymn of St Fortunatus,

*Quod Eva tristis abstulit,
tu reddis almo germine.*

The pun in Latin naturally fosters this imagery, as can be seen in the distich that accompanies a statue of the Virgin at Benoîte-Vaux, in Lorraine,

*Laeva gerit natum, gestat tua dextera malum;
mali per natum tollitur omne malum.*³⁸

A further connection of the Virgin with the apple is given by a mediaeval tale of an assassin who was being carried away by fiends after his death, because he had neither made confession nor received the sacraments. Since, however, during his life *valde honorabat beatam Virginem*, she interceded at his judgement and successfully claimed him as her own, in token of which she gave him a golden apple to hold in his hand. This apple, the tale continues, is still to be seen in St Peter's at Rome to bear witness to the fact.³⁹

(xxix) With Christ:

Geom. 294^r 7ff.

Ioann. Hildersheim, *Hist. Trium Regum*, 22f. pp. 238ff (cf. n. 37).

³⁸ Both these examples are given by Mgr Barbier de Montault (*Revue de l'Art Chrétien* [1889] 25), and are discussed by Gaidoz, "La réquisition d'amour et le symbolisme de la pomme," *Annuaire de l'École Pratique des Hautes Études* (1902) 22ff.

³⁹ Gaidoz' reference is Th. Wright, *Latin Stories* (London 1842) no. 145, pp. 130f.

The Three Kings of Cologne by John of Hildersheim (a very popular work in England, to judge from the large number of mss. of translations into the vernacular) contains the following interesting story: when the Magi made their offerings, *Malchiar xxx denarios aureos et pomum aureum paruum sicut manu concludi potuit, optulit Jhesu*. This apple (p. 239) *quondam fuit Allexandri magni et totaliter potuit manu concludi, mundum significans, quod ex minimis particulis tributorum omnium prouinciarum conflari fecit, et ipsum semper manu portauit et uelud sua potencia totum mundum manu concludit; quod pomum in India remansit quando de Persyde reuersus fuit. ipsius autem pomi rotunditas, que neque principium habet neque finem, significat illum qui uniuersum mundum, celum uidelicet et terram, sue potencie uirtute circumdat*. However (p. 240), *Christus tunc de uirgine natus, qui deponit potentes de sede et exaltat humiles, pomum, quod uniuersum mundum significauit, sua humilitate in potencie magnitudine in momento contriuit et ad nichilum redegit*. For the history of the orb, with and without a cross, that Christ is often depicted holding in his hand, see xxxix below.

In Geometres the rhetorician overcomes the priest, for as Christ is the spiritual panacea, so is the apple the physical.⁴⁰ Even more strangely he connects the apple with Cherubim and Seraphim (293^v 38ff) and, as it appears, the Trinity (294^r 3).

MISCELLANEOUS

(xxx) Inscriptions upon Apples:⁴¹

*Hes. frag. 85 (Rzach) apud Schol. Ven. A. in Hom. *Il.* 6.35.

⁴⁰ A full list of the ancient medicinal uses of apples (nowadays valued chiefly as a laxative and as a source of vitamin C) is out of place here, but it could be mentioned that they were eaten raw, baked, boiled, and compounded in recipes with dates, honey, meal, suet etc., and in drinks made from the flesh, core, and pips, although the superior nutritional value of the last does not seem to have been known. The different sorts of "apples" were used primarily as both astringents and diuretics of varying strengths, and thus were considered a cure for any sort of bellyache, but also their odour prevented vomiting, their juice was recommended for orthopnoea, they were one ingredient in a poultice for cardiac diseases, some were classed as *ψυκτήρια* and were consequently used in combating fevers, whilst others warmed the body, they helped to relieve arthritis and sciatica, and were beneficial in the diet of a man suffering from cholera, diabetes, and many diseases of the pulmonary, biliary, and urinary systems. Since from them even a woman in travail could gain some alleviation of her pains, and since they were considered to be also an antidote to poisons, the ancients fully believed the English adage.

⁴¹ For a possible inscription on the apple in the hand of the equestrian statue of Justinian in Constantinople, see xxxix.

Dieg. ad Call. *Aet.* 3 frag. 67 (Pfeiffer).

Nic. frag. 50 (Schneider) apud Athen. 3.82A (cf. n. 12).

*Luc. *Dial. Mar.* 5.

*Philostr. *Ep.* 62 (Kayser).

*Anton. Lib. 1.

Aristaenet. 1.10.

Max. Plan. *Metaphr. Ov. Her.* 2of (Dilthey, *De Callimachi Cydippa*, pp. 157ff).

Kallimachos et Chrysorrhoe, 1206ff.⁴²

*Ov. *Her.* 2of: *A.A.* 1.457f: *Tr.* 3.10.73f.

Florus (*Anth. Lat.* 1.248 [1.201]) (cf. n. 26).

Prim. Myth. Vat. 208 (Bode, 1. pp. 65f).

Sec. Myth. Vat. 205f (Bode, 1. pp. 142ff).

Tert. Myth. Vat. 11.20ff (Bode, 1. pp. 24of).

The apple that Eris threw before the gods has some such inscription as ἡ καλή λαβέτω (Lucian), Acontius' reads *Μά τήν Ἄρτεμιν, Ἀκοντίω γαμοῦμαι* (Aristaenetus), and Briseis writes *Μή σπεῦδ', Ἀχιλλεῦ, πρὶν Μονηρίαν ἐλεῖν· ὕδωρ γὰρ οὐκ ἔνεστι διψῶσιν κακῶς*. The apple used by Philostratus as a love letter is suitably inscribed *Ἐὐίππη, φιλῶ σε*, but the wench was requested to add the words *Κάγῳ σέ*.

(xxxii) Use as Garland or Prize of Victory:

(a) Use as garland alone:

Hippon. frag. 57 (Diehl) apud Athen. 2.49E.⁴³

*Philet. frag. 18 (Powell) apud Schol. in Theoc. 2.120.

*Call. frag. 412 (Pfeiffer) apud Schol. in Theoc. 2.120.

Mel. (*Anth. Pal.* 4.1.27).⁴⁴

Arist. *Iud. Ep. ad Philocr.* 6.63 (Pelletier).⁴⁵

(b) Use as Prize of Victory:⁴⁶

Luc. *Anach.* 9.

Phleg. frag. 1 (Mueller, *FHG* 3. pp. 603f).

Max. Tyr. *Diss.* 5.8: 7.4 (Duebner).

⁴² For the two inscriptions on this magic apple, see xliii.

⁴³ *στέφανον εἶχον κοκκινῶν καὶ μίνθης*.

⁴⁴ A garland from the apple tree is chosen by Meleager to honour Diotimus, on the problems of whose identity see A. S. F. Gow and D. L. Page, *The Greek Anthology, Hellenistic Epigrams*, 2. pp. 27of.

⁴⁵ On a table is carved in relief a *στέφανον πάγκαρπον* that includes *μήλα*.

⁴⁶ Athenaeus writes (3.80E), *Μήλα· ταῦτα Μνησίθεος ὁ Ἀθηναῖος ἐν τῷ περὶ ἔδεστων μῆλα Δελφικὰ καλεῖ*: this may be relevant to the use of apples at the Pythian Games. Possible numismatic evidence can be found in Cook (above, n. 29) 2. pp. 490ff.

Lib. 8.277 (Foerster).
Anth. Pal. 9.357.
Epigr. Gr. 931.1f (Kaibel).
 Geom. 292^r 9ff: 293^v 15.
 Auson. *Ecl.* 20 (Peiper).

Although the garland of victory at the Pythian Games was generally of bay, there is not inconsiderable evidence amongst later writers that the apple also, despite its apparent unsuitability, was used.⁴⁷ The following epigram from the *Greek Anthology* was sufficiently well known to be translated by Ausonius:

Τέσσαρες εἰσιν ἀγῶνες ἂν Ἑλλάδα, τέσσαρες ἱροί,
 οἱ δύο μὲν θνητῶν, οἱ δύο δ' ἀθανάτων·
 Ζηνός, Λητοῖδαο, Παλαίμονος, Ἀρχεμόρου.
 ἄθλα δὲ τῶν, κότινος, μῆλα, σέλινα, πίτυς.

The only authority given above who does not state that the apple tree provided the garland at the Pythian Games perhaps implies it, for in his long account of the reinstatement of the Olympic Games Phlegon of Tralles says that, after the first five celebrations had passed without the victors being awarded a symbol of their prowess, the Eleans sent a deputation to Delphi to enquire about the matter. The Pythian priestess suggested the wild olive, but first deemed it necessary to intone, Ἴφιτε, μήλειον καρπὸν μὴ θῆς ἐπὶ νίκη.

(xxxii) King of Trees:

Geom. 293^r 13ff: 293^v 16.⁴⁸

(xxxiii) Symbolism in Dreams:

Artemid. 1.66: 73.
 Geom. 292^r 8f.

According to Artemidorus, to look at and taste sweet apples (1.73), that are sacred to Aphrodite, is good, πολλήν γὰρ ἐπαφροδισίαν σημαίνει μάλιστα τοῖς περὶ γυναικὸς ἢ ἐρωμένης φροντίζουσι, but sour apples στάσεις καὶ φιλονεικίας σημαίνει· ἔστι γὰρ Ἐριδος, and to drink μελίμηλον

⁴⁷ Ovid was aware of garlands from different trees, since in his description of the first Pythian Games (*Met.* 1.446ff) the victors are honoured with a crown of oak, for Apollo himself, before the existence of the bay tree, used to wreath his temples with foliage *de qualibet arbore*.

⁴⁸ With greater justification and support from other authorities Geometres (287^r 36f) makes this claim also for the oak tree.

(1.66) is good for the rich, but bad for the poor. Geometres says merely that the apple, as opposed to the fig, is *εὐάγγελον* in dreams.

(xxxiv) Symbolic of Virtues:

Meliteniotes *Paradis.* 2064ff.

This comes from a description of a statue of Heracles in Paradise:

καὶ οὕτως ἀφελόμενος ταῦτα τὰ τρία μῆλα,
ἤγουν τὰς τρεῖς περιφανεῖς ἀρετὰς καὶ μεγάλας,
τὸ μὴ ὀργίζεσθαι κατὰρ κατὰ τινος εὐκόλως,
τὸ μὴ ποσῶς φιλαργυρεῖν ἐν ἀκορέστῳ γνώμῃ,
καὶ τὸ μὴ πᾶν ταῖς τρυφαῖς φιληδονεῖν τοῦ βίου.

(xxxv) Symbolic of Past, Present, and Future etc.:

Ioann. Lyd. *De Mensibus* 4.46.

John the Lydian says that the third day of April is sacred to Heracles, briefly describes the festival, and adds, *τρία δὲ αὐτῷ μῆλα ἐν τῇ λαϊᾷ ταῖν χεροῖν, τῆς χρόνου δι' αὐτοῦ ἀναμερίσεως σύμβολον· μῆλον μὲν γὰρ διὰ τὴν πρὸς τὸν καιρὸν αὐτοῦ συμπάθειαν, ἀρχὴ δὲ χρόνου ἐαρινῆ τροπῆ. καὶ ἄλλως δὲ τρία, ὅτι τριμερῆς ὁ χρόνος. ἀνάγειν δὲ λέγεται τὸν κύνα τὸν τρικέφαλον ἐκ τοῦ Ἄιδου, ὅτι φρουρητικός καὶ λυμαντικός ὁ χρόνος, ὡσπερ δὴ καὶ ὁ κύων τρεῖς δὲ αὐτῷ κεφαλαί, ὃ τε παρελθὼν καὶ ὁ ἐνεστώσ καὶ ὁ μέλλον καιρός. καὶ ἄλλως δὲ τὰ τρία μῆλα ληπτέον ἐπὶ Ἡρακλέους κατὰ φιλόσοφον δόγμα, ὅτι τὰς τρεῖς περιόδους ὁ ἥρωσ ἀνύσας τοῦ πρακτικοῦ βίου τέλειος εἶναι δοκεῖ. ταύτη καὶ τριέσπερος λέγεται κατὰ Λυκόφρονα, φησὶ γάρ· Ἐτρεσπέρου λέοντος, ὃν ποτε γνάθοις | Τρίτωνος ἠμάλαψε κάρχαρος κύων' (Lyc. 33f). τὸ γὰρ τρισὶ νυξὶν ἐσπάρθαι τὸν Ἡρακλέα μυθικόν ἐστιν.*

(xxxvi) Likened to the Stars:

Schol. in Hes. *Theog.* 215.

Eudok. Aug. *Violar.* 356 (Flach, pp. 277f).

Geom. 293^r 29f: 293^v 13.

Eustath. 1572.45 (in Hom. *Od.* 7.115).

Geometres calls the apple *καὶ γῆς ἄστρον καὶ ἀστέρων σύμβολον* and *ἀστέρων μίμημα* simply because it is both round and shining like the stars, but the other authorities relate the following absurd allegory of the apples of the Hesperides (I quote the version of Eudokia): ἡ δὲ ἀλληγορία τὰς Ἐσπερίδας ἐσπερινὰς ὥρας λαμβάνει, μῆλα δὲ χρυσᾶ

τὰ ἄστρο, Ἑρακλέα δὲ τὸν ἥλιον. παρερχομένου γὰρ τοῦ ἡλίου, τὰ ἄστρο οὐκ ἔτι φαίνονται, ὃ ἔστι τὸ τρυγήσαι τὸν Ἑρακλέα τὰ μήλα.

(xxxvii) Likened to the Sun:

Anaxag. apud Geom. 293^r 27ff (cf. id. 293^v 13).

Ἄναξαγόρας δὲ μῆλω καὶ τὸν ἥλιον αὐτὸν εἰκάζει· καὶ ὁ λόγος αἰρεῖ, ὧ γὰρ τὸ σχῆμα σφαιρικόν, τῷ κύκλῳ δὲ φλογερόν, τίνι ἂν ἄλλῃ εἰκασθεῖη δικαίως ἢ μῆλω πάντως παντόθεν ἐρυθρῷ;

There are six authorities for Anaxagoras' belief that the sun is *μύδρος*,⁴⁹ whilst Josephus alone records *μύλος*.⁵⁰ Nevertheless, in Geometres there can be no doubt that the true reading is *μῆλω* since any other word would be irrelevant in the context, and in the peroration of this encomium the apple is apostrophized as being *inter alia* ἡλίου εἰκῶν. It is possible that Anaxagoras did compare the sun with an apple in shape and colour, the two features emphasized here (this is not necessarily incompatible with his view that the sun is larger than the Peloponnese⁵¹), but it is far more likely that Geometres either saw a corrupt ms. or "corrected" *μύλος*.⁵²

Although classical literature cannot, it seems, offer even a remote parallel to this, mention may be made of an ancient Roumanian folk tale that has been illogically Christianized: in order to quieten her crying babe, the Virgin Mother gave him two apples, which he petulantly tossed away to the skies: there they became the sun and the moon.⁵³

(xxxviii) Likened to the Universe:

Geom. 292^r 6f: 293^v 14.

Geometres, concerned with shape alone, says *καὶ σχῆμα τῷ μῆλω τὸ τοῦ παντός ἐστι μίμημα*, and later in his description of the apple he calls it *σχῆμα τῶν ὄντων*.

⁴⁹ Schol. in Pind. (A 20a): Schol. in Eur. *Or.* (A 20a): Olymp. in Arist. *Met.* (A 19): Aët. (A 72): Harp. (A 2): D.L. (A 1). This belief is ascribed also to Democritus (A 87) and Gorgias (B 31). (All references are to the numbers of the fragments of the respective philosophers in Diels, *Vorsokr.*¹⁰)

⁵⁰ A 19.

⁵¹ Aët. (A 72): D.L. (A 1): Hippol. *Haer.* (A 42).

⁵² Had Geometres by some chance come across an imperial copper coin of Clazomenae (*Brit. Mus. Cat. Coins Ionia*, p. 33, pl. 7.9, whereon see Cook [above, n. 29] i. p. 51) that depicts Anaxagoras holding a small orb in his outstretched right hand, he would probably have called it an "apple," since it is in the artistic tradition of the Orb of Dominion (see xxxix), an example of which he could see daily in Constantinople in the equestrian statue of Justinian.

⁵³ See P. Gordon, *L'Image du Monde dans l'Antiquité*, p. 91.

(xxxix) The Orb of Dominion:⁵⁴

Geom. 293^v 19ff.

Kedren. (Bonn, 1. pp. 656f).

Meliteniotes *Paradis*. 1548f.

Ioann. Hildersheim, *Hist. Trium Regum*, 22f. pp. 238ff: 41. pp. 273f.

Gotefridus Viterbiensis (apud Du Cange, *Gloss. med. et inf. Lat.* [ed. 1886] sub *palla*).

In Constantinople there was a very famous equestrian statue of Justinian that has been described in detail by historians,⁵⁵ and mentioned by foreign travellers.⁵⁶ The Emperor's right hand was raised against the Persians in the East, and in his left hand he held an orb, surmounted by a cross, which, as the Arab Qazwini reports, some thought to have been inscribed with the words, "I own the world as long as this ball is in my hand." The fact that Kedrenos in his description of the statue calls this very orb *μῆλον* we could attribute to individual whim, were it not for the following supporting evidence:

(a) John of Hildersheim says of the same statue, *habet pomum aureum rotundum more imperiali in sinistra*.

(b) The orb that Alexander the Great had made from the tribute of the provinces in his empire and that Melchior gave to Christ (see xxix above) is always called *pomum* by John of Hildersheim. Moreover, he says that *uniuersum mundum significauit*.

(c) Geometres calls the apple *ἐγγενείας ἅμα καὶ βασιλείας σύμβολον*, and says that for this reason it was held in the hand by Heracles, Alexander the Great, Julius Caesar, and Zeus.⁵⁷

(d) Meliteniotes' description of the statue of Zeus in Paradise contains

⁵⁴ *μῆλον* is twice used of an orb without any connotation of dominion: these instances are given in li.

⁵⁵ Procop. *De Aedif.* 1.2: Suda, s.v. *Ιουστινιανός*: Leo Gramm. (Bonn, p. 227): Kedren. (Bonn, 1. pp. 656f): Mich. Glyk. (Bonn, p. 505): Kodin. (Bonn, p. 29). It is mentioned, but not described, also by Theophanes (Bonn, 1. p. 347). An old drawing of the statue is reproduced in *REG* 9 (1896) 84.

⁵⁶ Qazwini (J. Marquart, *Osteurop. und ostasiatische Streifzüge* [1903] p. 221): Harun ibn Yahya (ibid. p. 220): Bertrandon de la Broquière (*Le Voyage d'Outremer* [1892] p. 159). I am indebted for these references to a very interesting paper by R. M. Dawkins entitled "Ancient Statues in Mediaeval Constantinople" (*Folklore* 35 [1924] 209ff).

⁵⁷ Geometres (293^v 18f) thinks that the butts, or *μῆλα*, of the spears of the Persian *μηλοφόροι*, the king's bodyguard, also signify power; but he is carried away by his quest for virtues of the apple. (Gordon [above, n. 53], p. 93, bluntly states that from them we can understand "une ancienne confrérie d'initiés.")

the words, τὰ τρία δὲ σφαιροειδῆ μῆλα τὰ ἐν τῷ σκήπτρῳ | αἰνίττονται τῶν οὐρανῶν δεσπότην καὶ τοῦ κόσμου.

(e) Gotefridus Viterbiensis calls the orb an apple, *Aureus ille Globus Pomum vel Palla vocatur, | quando coronatur, Palla ferenda datur.*

(f) The following lines occur in the *Chanson de Roland* (29.386ff):

En sa main tint une vermeille pume:
 "Tenez, bel sire," dist Rollant a sun uncle,
 "De trestuz reis vos present les curunes."

(g) There exists in German the word "Reichsapfel," best known in connection with the imperial orb of Charlemagne in the Kunsthistorisches Museum in Vienna.

The earlier existence of the orb of dominion is attested by many coins of Imperial Rome which portray Jupiter presenting an orb to the Emperor, and especially by one whereon Trajan offers the symbol to his successor Hadrian.⁵⁸ A. B. Cook propounds the theory that this orb, essentially the same as that sometimes placed by Jupiter's throne or used as a footstool, is derived from the ball upon a square pedestal that was both a grave stele and a boundary stone of the Etruscans.⁵⁹ It is, however, no flight of fancy to believe more simply that an orb in the hand is the most natural way in which an artist could indicate dominion over the world.

The Christians quickly adopted the symbol,⁶⁰ to which they added the cross to denote that empire was dependent upon their faith. Nevertheless, a French glass of the thirteenth century on which the Virgin is depicted giving her son an orb,⁶¹ and various statues of Christ holding an orb alone show the survival of the classical prototypes.

⁵⁸ Rasche, *Lex. Num.* 3.15.1464: an illustration is given by Cook (above, n. 29) 1. p. 47. fig. 19.

⁵⁹ 1. pp. 47ff (above, n. 29). Justice cannot be given to his argument in a short compass: it is basically dependent upon a reconstruction of the appearance of Apollonius' statue of Jupiter Capitolinus that places an orb by his throne, and the fact that his first temple was largely Etruscan and built on a site already sacred to Terminus.

⁶⁰ Two of the earliest examples are an orb beneath the foot of Christ on a piece of gilded glass, found in a catacomb, of the fourth century (see F. Buonarroti, *Osservazioni sopra alcuni frammenti di vasi antichi di vetro* [Firenze 1716] pp. 110ff. pl. 17.1), and God seated upon an orb in the right lateral apse of the Mausoleo di S. Costanza, both of which are very similar to representations of Jupiter. Illustrations of these two works are to be found in Cook (above, n. 29) 1. pp. 49f. figg. 22f, where they are discussed.

⁶¹ Described by De Marsy, *Bulletin de la Société des Antiquaires de France* (1876) p. 200.

Finally it can be remarked that the orb of the British sovereign is divided into three parts, the upper two symbolizing Europe and Asia, the lower one Africa. The word "apple," however, in this connection the Germans alone retain.⁶²

(xl) Not to be eaten at the Eleusinian Mysteries:

Porph. *De Abst.* 4.16.

Jul. *Or.* 5.174B.

This prohibition is clearly connected with Persephone's eating of pomegranate seeds in Hades. Since the authorities above specify both pomegranates and μήλα, it is likely that any food with pips or seeds was forbidden at the Mysteries as too grim a reminder of the great tragedy.

(xli) Use in Ritual of the Dead:

*Hyg. *Fab.* 104.

(xlii) Symbolic of the Passing of Life:

PLM (Baehrens) 6. p. 405.

*Poma ut in arboribus, pendent sic corpora nostra:
aut matura cadunt aut cito acerba ruunt.*⁶³

(xliii) The Apple of Life and Death:

Kallimachos et Chrysorrhoeë, 1206ff.

The crone γράμμασι κακομαγικοῖς καὶ λόγοις μαντευμάτων / ἐπέδευσεν, ἐδέσμευσεν a beautiful golden apple which she inscribes with this double charm:

“ ἄν ἄνθρωπος εἰς κόρφον του τὸ μήλον τοῦτο βάλη,
νεκρὸς ὅς κείται παρευθὺς, ἄπνους εὐθὺς ὅς ἐν.
ἄν δέ τις εἰς τὴν μύτην του τοῦ νεκρωμένου πάλιν
θήσῃ τὸ μήλον τὸ χρυσοῦν, ζήτω καὶ μὲ τοὺς ζῶντας
ίχνεύειν καὶ περιπατεῖν καὶ κόσμον περιτρέχειν.”

⁶² For the connection between the Byzantine Apple of Dominion and the Turks' belief in the "Red Apple" and the mysterious "Land of the Red Apple-Tree," see R. M. Dawkins' paper in *Ἐπιτύμβιον Χρήστου Τσοῦντα* (Athens 1941) 401ff.

⁶³ This seems to be a variation on the theme of Homer's famous lines in the *Iliad* (6.146ff). W. Mannhardt relates (*Baumkultus*, p. 412) that in Nuremberg girls used to carry an apple on a branch from a beech: this represented Death.

Under the pretence of rewarding the hero for slaying the dragon, she presents him with this apple, which he places in his bosom; he consequently expires immediately (1311). Meanwhile his brothers dream that danger threatens him (1329ff), search for, find, and lament him before discovering the apple that now reads (1407f),

“εἴ τις ἀναίσθητος νεκρὸς μυρίσεται τὸ μῆλον,
αἰσθησὼν λάβῃ παρευθὺς, ἐξαναζήσει πάλιν.”

They promptly apply it to his nose, and he sits up completely restored.

Save for the strange story about Aristotle in the next section, this is unparalleled in classical literature. It is tempting to link this magic fruit with such myths as that of the golden apples in the guardianship of the goddess Iduna, that were regularly eaten for purposes of rejuvenation by the Nordic deities.⁶⁴

(xliv) Preserver of Life:

Arist. *Liber de Pomo*, pp. 44: 64 (Marianus Plezia, *Aristotelis qui ferebatur Liber de Pomo* [Acad. Scient. Polona]).

The relevant passages are (p. 44), *Aristotelis uero de ipsis fecit ridiculum dicens: Non cogitatis in cordibus uestris, quod ego letor, eo quod sperem euadere a nimia infirmitate, quam habeo; quoniam bene scio nunc me moriturum nec possum euadere, quia dolor multum excreuit; et nisi esset hoc pomum quod manu mea teneo et quod odor suus confortat et aliquantum prolongat uitam meam, iam exspirassem. Set anima sensibilis, in qua communicamus cum bestiis, fouetur odore bono . . .* and (p. 64), *Et cum applicuisset sapiens ad finem horum sermonum, inceperunt manus sue titubare, a quibus pomum cecidit, quod tenebat. Et cum cepisset nigrescere facies, exspirauit.*⁶⁵

⁶⁴ The legend may be more familiar to some from Wagner's *Rheingold* (second scene): when Donner's hammer sinks and the gods grow old and grey, Loge sings, "Von Freias Frucht / genosset ihr heute noch nicht. / Die goldnen Äpfel / in ihrem Garten / sie machten euch tüchtig und jung, / asst ihr sie jeden Tag."

⁶⁵ The odour of the apple is emphasized here as in the previous tale, where the fruit has to be applied to the hero's nose to bring him back to life. That this is so is not very surprising when it is considered that the smell of "apples" is probably their most subtle and delicious feature. A few ancient aspects of this may be found of interest. Aristocratic Parthians ate the pips of the citron with their food so that their sweet fragrance would overcome the smell of wine (Verg. *Georg.* 2.134f; Plin. *N.H.* 11.115.278: *ibid.* 12.7.16), in the dearth of moth balls citrons were placed among clothes (Ar. *Vesp.* 1055f; Theophr. *H.P.* 4.4.2: Plin. *N.H.* 12.7.15; Macrobi. *Sat.* 3.19.4f), a practice, as I am assured by a colleague, still followed in some rural areas of Scotland with apples, and a perfume was made

APPENDIX

The following list of meanings of the word *μῆλον*, involving no symbolism, belongs solely to the realm of lexicography.⁶⁶

(xlv) Cheeks:⁶⁷

- *Schol. in Ar. *Eccl.* 903.
- Theoc. 26.1.⁶⁸
- P. Petr.* 3. p. 2 et al.
- BGU 998.4 et al.
- Zon. (*Anth. Pal.* 9.556).
- Ruf. *Onom.* 35: 46⁶⁹ et Schol. ad loc.
- Aret. 4.21 (Hude) et al.⁷⁰
- Luc. *Imagg.* 6.
- Epig. Gr.* 243.12 (Kaibel).
- Arch. Pap.* 4.271.
- Athanas. *De Virg.* 11 (Migne, PG 28.263).

(xlvi) Swelling under the Eye:

Hesych. s.v. *κύλα*.

(xlvii) Swelling of the Cornea of the Eye:⁷¹

from quinces (*μῆλινον μύρον*, described by Theophrastus, *Od.* 26: 28: 31). The fragrance of apples is, of course, mentioned in erotic contexts (e.g. Philostr. *Imagg.* 1.15.3: Aristaenet. 1.10: *ibid.* 12), and Digenes Akrites even calls his sweetheart (*Cod. Treb.* 7.1991) *ρόδον μου εὐθαλόφυτον, μῆλόν μου μυρισμένον* (cf. Geom. 291^v 31). Columella alone (12.44.8) sullies their bouquet, *Illud in totum maxime praecipimus, ne in eodem loco mala et uvae componantur, neve in vicino, unde odor malorum possit ad eas pervenire. Nam huius modi habitu celeriter acina corrumpuntur.*

⁶⁶ *LSJ* do not mention xlvii and li. For other objects called *μῆλα* through similarity of shape, see xiii, xxxvi–xxxix.

⁶⁷ Cf. Lat. *malum*. (*LSJ* quote the three papyrological references: I have not verified them.)

⁶⁸ Agave is called *μαλοπάρανος*: this may mean “white-cheeked” (see Gow ad loc.).

⁶⁹ *Μῆλα δὲ τὰ ὑπὸ τοῖς ὀφθαλμοῖς ἐξάρματα τοῦ προσώπου, ἃ δὴ καὶ αἰδουμένων ἡμῶν ἐρυθραίνεται. ἀπὸ δὲ τῶν μῆλων αἱ παρειαί: καλοῦνται καὶ σιαγόνες, καὶ γνάθοι.* It appears, then, that Rufus understands by *μῆλον* the upper, rounded part of the cheek.

⁷⁰ *μῆλον* is Aretaeus’ regular word for “cheek” (see Hude’s *index verborum*).

⁷¹ The English expression “the apple of the eye” occurs first in the writings of King Alfred and in the West Saxon Psalter as a translation of *pupilla oculi* (cf. Germ. “Augapfel”). M. B. Ogle suggests (*TAPA* 73 [1942] 181ff) that it may have arisen from a misreading of *pupilla* as *pila*, “ball,” an occasional meaning of “apple” in Anglo-Saxon literature. The later erotic connotation is due simply to the eye being “the most valuable and highly cherished human organ.”

Alex. Trall. *Περὶ ὀφθαλμῶν* (Puschmann, p. 152).

καὶ τὸ καλούμενον μῆλον σταφυλώματος εἶδος ἐστὶν εὐμεγέθους οὕτως ὡς ὑπεραίρειν καὶ τὰ βλέφαρα, παρατριβόμενον δὲ ταῖς βλεφαρίσιν παρενοχλεῖν ἀπάσαις.

(xlviii) Tonsil:

Ruf. *Onom.* 64.

(xlix) Seed-Vessel of the Rose:

Theophr. *H.P.* 6.6.6.

(l) Cup in Shape of Apple:⁷²

IG 11(2).161B41 et al.

(li) Orb:

Kodin. (Bonn, pp. 29f).

Script. Orig. Constantinopl. (Preger, I. p. 94).

Besides references to the Orb of Dominion (see xxxix above), some spheres upon a cross are called μῆλα by Kodinos, and for the usual σφαῖρα above the baldachin some mss. of the anonymous description of the building of Hagia Sophia read μῆλον.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Although many writers, following in the footsteps of Clearchus of Soli,⁷³ have touched upon this subject, a useful⁷⁴ bibliography need not include any material earlier than Dilthey's famous reconstruction of Callimachus' version of the tale of Acontius and Cydippe.

⁷² The diminutive *μηλίσκον* also is found (*IG* 11[2].162B32).

⁷³ Frag. 39 (Mueller, *FHG* 2, pp. 315f) apud Athen. 553E ff. In answer to his own question Clearchus first proposes that people carry in the hand apples, flowers, and similar objects because nature can thereby reveal those who have a love for beauty. He then suggests that they are a token to others of amorous propensities, or serve as a consolation for the absence of the beloved, but in his perplexity he eventually comes to the conclusion that the reason is simply the loveliness of fruit and flowers.

⁷⁴ Since some writers have to their disadvantage been unaware of work done by their predecessors, this bibliography and the references elsewhere in the notes to material on more restricted themes may be of some use. The search for these items (and for a few others that have been rejected as adding nothing of relevant interest) has not been easy, and consequently no claim is made for completeness.

(i) C. Dilthey, *De Callimachi Cydippa* (Leipzig 1863).

A brief section (pp. 112ff) is devoted to the erotic symbolism of the apple in classical authors.

(ii) M. Fränkel, "Zur Erklärung der Venus von Milo," *Arch. Zeit.* 31 (1874) pp. 36ff.

Examples of the erotic symbolism are gathered to support an interpretation of the apple that may once have been in the hand of the "Venus de Milo."

(iii) R. Wende, *Quaestiones Mythologicae de Hesperidum Fabula* (Breslau 1875).

This dissertation, carefully surveying ancient sources and reviewing more modern theories, is essential for any further work on the myth. Wende himself suggests that there is an analogy between the Apples of the Hesperides and those in the keeping of Iduna.

(iv) B. O. Foster, "Notes on the Symbolism of the Apple in Classical Antiquity," *HSCP* 10 (1899) pp. 39ff.

This "rich collection of material,"⁷⁵ the only attempt at a comprehensive study of the apple as a token of love, is the basis of other articles and the reference work of editors. It is, however, far from complete, and entirely ignores Byzantine literature and non-erotic aspects.

(v) H. Gaidoz, "La Réquisition d'Amour et le Symbolisme de la Pomme," *Annuaire de l'École Pratique des Hautes Études* (1902) pp. 5ff.

There are five sections: "En Irlande" deals with an interesting Irish legend of an ever-renewed apple that a fairy gives Concla when she offers to lead him to the land of immortality: the principal value of "Chez les Grecs" is a description of many artistic representations of the apple being used as an erotic token: for "La Vierge à la Pomme" see xxviii above: in "Aux Antipodes" is related a custom from Tahiti of throwing a fruit similar to the apple: finally Gaidoz rhetorically dismisses symbolism in "Le Symbolisme de la Pomme" by concluding that fruits like the apple were used because they were easily available, and for the purely ballistic reason that they are convenient to throw.

(vi) N. G. Polites, "Βυζαντινὰ Παράδοσεις, Γ', 'Κασία,'" *Laographia* 6 (1917) pp. 359ff.

In this note on the story of the marriage of Theophilus, the erotic symbolism of the apple in antiquity is briefly discussed, and a few

⁷⁵ McCartney (see viii below) p. 72.

references are added to Foster's collection. For further illustration parallels are drawn from the folklore of the Balkans, Georgia, etc.

(vii) J. Lajti, "The Apples of the Hesperides," *EPhK* 47 (1924) pp. 15ff.

This paper, which I have not seen, is in Hungarian. Marouzeau's summary is "le rite de la pomme avait pour but de conjurer pendant la nuit des noces les démons 'Hespérides' dont la tradition se rattache au culte d'Artémis."

(viii) E. S. McCartney, "How the Apple Became the Token of Love," *TAPA* 56 (1925) pp. 70ff.

The thesis is propounded that fruits "of the apple-kind" were chosen because their pips symbolized fecundity.⁷⁶ Support for this is provided by references to the fertile significance of other fruits and of vegetables that have seeds in folklore ancient and modern, European, Asian, and North American.

(ix) P. Gordon, *L'Image du Monde dans l'Antiquité* (Paris 1949).

In a chapter entitled "Le Pommier et les Pommes d'Or" (pp. 83ff) Gordon accepts the identification of Apollo as an "apple-deity" and imaginatively invests the Apples of the Hesperides with an initiatory significance, illustrated by an array of legends from various European and Near Eastern cultures.⁷⁷

(x) T. Smerdel, "Le Motif de la Pomme," *Živa Antika* 2 (1952) pp. 241ff.

This article, which is in Croatian with a French summary, consists principally of an analysis of epithets and imagery in passages connected with the apple in Sappho, Aristophanes, Longus, the Greek Anthology, Vergil, and Ovid, and of a comparison with some pieces of Yugoslavian poetry.⁷⁸

(xi) G. Martin, "Golden Apples and Golden Boughs," *Studies Presented to David Moore Robinson*, vol. 2 (St. Louis 1953) pp. 1191ff.

⁷⁶ This idea is not new: H. F. Tozer writes, "The apple was used as a love-offering, not, I think, as resembling the breasts, but from its pips, as a sign of fecundity" (this is quoted without reference by R. Ellis in his note on Catullus 65.19).

⁷⁷ According to Gordon (p. 96) "le terme *mala* (=pommes) en était venu, nous dit Servius, à désigner les deux testicules," but, as usual, he gives no reference, and I can find no such passage in Servius.

⁷⁸ Smerdel has himself translated into Latin (*Živa Antika* 12.2 [1963] p. 386) two poems on the apple by Milan Begović and Dobriša Cesarić.

After a brief mention of the connection between the Apples of the Hesperides and love and marriage, the point is argued that in the original myth of Heracles' translation to Olympus the token of his acceptance there was these apples (compared with Vergil's Golden Bough), a trace of which idea is preserved by Diodorus Siculus (4.26.4), who gives this labour not as the penultimate, but as the last.⁷⁹

(xii) J. Trumpf, "Kydonische Äpfel," *Hermes* 88 (1960) pp. 14ff.

With a fragment of Ibycus (Page, 5) as starting point, the erotic symbolism of the apple and "der Wundergarten" are briefly discussed.

CONCLUSION

Of the forty-four facets into which the symbolism of the apple has been divided, many are easily explicable, being accidental, etymological, or due to similarity of shape, and need no further comment. Since, however, there is a difference of opinion over the reason why the fruit is a token of love, a few remarks on this aspect may not be superfluous.

Foster is right in rejecting the hypothesis that the likeness of an apple to a woman's breast gave rise to the phenomenon, for, as far as we know, that imagery was not used before the comic poets. Gaidoz' theory of the availability and convenience of the fruit is clearly a partial explanation, but the most important factor is, I believe, the fructifying significance of the pips, for which McCartney ably argues.⁸⁰ The apple is, after all, in our oldest sources connected rather with marriage,⁸¹ the especial occasion on which fertility is openly encouraged, than with flirtation. Apples are the wedding gift of Ge to Zeus and Hera, apples help Hippomenes to win his bride, apples are thrown at the chariot of Menelaus and Helen at their marriage, an apple correctly bestowed gains Helen for Paris, to an apple on a treetop is a bride likened by Sappho, and an apple, according to a law of Solon, must be eaten by a bride on the night of her wedding.

Nevertheless, this does not explain why the apple was chosen in preference to nuts, grain, vegetables, etc. McCartney, in quoting the eulogy of the fruit in Plutarch's *Symposiacs* (5.8.1), has the courage

⁷⁹ Cf. *Anth. Plan.* 92: *Epig. Gr.* 1082.13f (Kaibel): *Hilas. (Anth. Lat.* 1.627 [2.95f]).

⁸⁰ His general thesis is sound, and not invalidated by the suggestion that the nibbled apples sent by or to courtesans and meretricious wives in Lucian (see n. 15) are analogous to the seeds of fruits that when eaten, if we believe the folklore of many nations, promote fertility in men and women.

⁸¹ An exception is the tale of Achilles and Briseis, if it is "Hesiodic" (see n. 8).

to follow Clearchus in making the naïve suggestion that the apple gained the distinction because of its beauty. The restriction of the fruit, however, in the ritual of marriage, to the apple is not likely to be fundamental. It is not unreasonable to suppose that when an original belief in the efficacy of throwing a seedbearing fruit to promote fecundity waned, the tradition was preserved partly because it was an amusing and pleasant spectacle. Then, the serious purpose being no longer dominant, attention could be bestowed upon the beauty of appearance, fragrance, taste, and touch. The choice of the apple was subsequently adopted by lovers for their own games, for what more lovely fruit of the earth could they bestow upon their beloved ones than the apple, a thing, in the neat phrase of Philostratus,⁸² *αὐτόματον καλόν*?

UNIVERSITY OF WESTERN ONTARIO

⁸² *Ep.* 27 (Kayser).