

## Tracing *Tarbiya*: The Political Economy of Pedagogy in Ottoman Lebanon

### Introduction

In the last decades of the nineteenth century, the question of how to raise a child became the subject of passionate debate among thinkers in Beirut and Cairo, twin hearts of the Arab intellectual world. Questions about school curricula and how to teach a child not to lie consumed mothers and policymakers; Muslim shaykhs, Christian priests, and foreign missionaries; and men and women writers in the Arabic press. All saw the reformation of mothers and schools as key to producing an Arab world capable of “progress” and “development” in the face of European colonialism, economic transformation, and rapid technological change. Their discussions revolved around the concept of *tarbiya*, an old Arabic term for domesticating animals that began in the mid-nineteenth century to refer to new structures of formal schooling, new pedagogies, and to the female labor of childrearing, moral cultivation, and subject formation in the home.

This paper argues that the concept of *tarbiya* emerged in response to transformations in the political economy of education in nineteenth-century Lebanon.<sup>1</sup> Beginning in the 1830s, an Ottoman reform movement, a period of Egyptian occupation (1832-41), and the rise of European protections and missionary activity threatened to fundamentally transform relationships between elites and the people, the *ahali*. New ideas about equality and practices of representative governance intended by Cairo and later by Istanbul to connect provincial elites to the center and to facilitate tax collection sparked a series of revolts by Lebanese peasants against their landlords.

---

<sup>1</sup> There was no stable administrative category contiguous with the borders of contemporary Lebanon in the late nineteenth century. This chapter will focus on the cities of Beirut and Tripoli and the area that became the independent governorate (*mutasarafiyya*) of Mt. Lebanon in 1861. I use "Ottoman Lebanon" to refer to these territories and "Lebanese" for their inhabitants for convenience, not to imply that present borders were inevitable.

As these threats to the Lebanese social order gathered, European and American missionaries, Lebanese elites, and Ottoman statesmen founded hundreds of new schools at the primary, secondary, and tertiary levels, fundamentally altering education and upbringing in Lebanon. Despite diverse origins, agendas, and sources of support, these institutions shared a rhetorical commitment to education as a means to individual and communal transformation, while they also taught--and often delivered--obedience and social stability on their own terms. In this context, *tarbiya* and pedagogical thought more generally became a plausible language for articulating both the tantalizing possibility of individual transformation and communal progress, as well as hopes that particular versions of the social order--in Arabic, *al-hay'ah al-ijtima' iyyah*—could be stabilized once and for all.

This paper proposes a new direction for non-Western intellectual history. Recent scholarship has approached the intellectual history of the non-West as a matter of the circulation or creative translation of Western ideas to new contexts.<sup>2</sup> Other scholars have explored how conceptual developments with global reach were driven by the rise of global capitalism, which introduced new forms of social relations.<sup>3</sup> I take a different tack, arguing that specific transformations in local political economies are key to the history of concepts in the non-West and elsewhere. I propose an alternative model for "global" conceptual history that highlights the relationship between concepts and local social transformations, rather than focusing on processes of translation or exploring how different locations assimilate to capitalist forms. How might the specific transformations that led to the plasticity and importance of pedagogical thought in Ottoman Lebanon resemble analogous transformations elsewhere? Might these resemblances

---

<sup>2</sup> See, for example, Elshakry (2014), Khuri-Makdisi (2010), "Global Liberalisms" in *Modern Intellectual History*, (Nov 2015). Omnia El Shakry has expanded this argument to argue that *tarbiya* emerged from both European social thought and the conceptual possibilities of the Islamic tradition. See El Shakry in Abu-Lughod (1998).

<sup>3</sup> Sartori (2008).

account for global interest in education and pedagogy at this time? Such questions would allow us to construct a global intellectual history capable of identifying transnational, trans-linguistic, and/or trans-cultural resonances and fissures in concepts that do not necessarily derive their coherence from capitalism or from particular paths of transmission and translation.

This paper begins by offering two examples of *tarbiya's* circulation to suggest its remarkable plasticity. Next, it traces the political economy of pedagogy produced by three educational networks in nineteenth-century Lebanon: a French Catholic network built around Lebanon's Maronite community, a Protestant network built around American missionaries and their Lebanese interlocutors, and a Sunni Muslim network built around the Maqasid Islamic Benevolent Society (*Jama'iyat al-Maqasid al-Khairiyya al-Islamiyya*) and the Ottoman state.<sup>4</sup> I show how each of these networks opened up a notion that education could be a broadly-available path to individual and communal transformation, while also serving to uphold hierarchical visions of Lebanese social order.

### Two Invocations

"It is necessary that parents begin immediately to educate their children in perfect obedience (*al-ta'a al-kamila*) and to train them in submission (*al-huduwwa*) while they are small, so that these will not be impossible when they grow up. For subordinating the child when he is small is much easier than subordinating him when he is grown, just as it is easier to plant a seed than to plant a tree."<sup>5</sup>

Thus reads the parenting advice of an 1850 treatise published by the newly-established Syrian Evangelical Church in Beirut, entitled "A Treatise on the *Tarbiya* of Children" (*Risala fi*

---

<sup>4</sup> The Maronite Church is a uniate Catholic church with a Patriarch based at Bkirké in Mt. Lebanon; adherents are spread throughout the Levant and the Lebanese diaspora.

<sup>5</sup> Syrian Evangelical Church, *Risala fi Tarbiyat al-Adfal* [Treatise on the Upbringing of Children] (Beirut: al-Matba'a al-Amrikiyya, 1850), 16. Consulted with the permission of the Archives of the Near Eastern School of Theology (NEST). Unless otherwise noted, all translations are by the author.

*Tarbiyat al-Awlad*). The Treatise's intention was to "clarify, in a clear and accessible fashion, the duties [of parents], with an eye to some of the laws that parents should observe" and it covered parenting expectations ranging from how to feed and clothe a child to how to arrange for his or her education (in Arabic, *ta'lim*).<sup>6</sup> These expectations carried high stakes: God would reward those who attend to the *tarbiya* of their children "in this life and the next," but those who were careless with it would "provoke the wrath of God and be harshly punished."<sup>7</sup>

Forty-six years later, in 1896, Sheikh Mohammed 'Abduh gave a rousing speech entitled "*khitab fi al-tarbiya*" on the same subject as the Evangelical's 1850 treatise. He spoke at the annual celebration of the Cairo-based Islamic Benevolent Society (*Jama'iyya Islamiyya Khairiyya*) he had helped to found in Cairo in 1892. In the speech, 'Abduh declared that Muslim unity (*al-itihad*) "is the fruit of a tree that has shoots, branches, and leaves. Virtuous ethics (*ahlaq*), in all their levels, are the roots of that tree. And so," he concluded, "if Muslims want unity [as 'Abduh certainly thought they should], it is upon them to raise themselves (*yurubbu enfusihim*) according to a true Islamic *tarbiya* (*tarbiya islamiyya haqiqiyya*) in order to bring forth the fruit [of unity]."<sup>8</sup> If they do not, he enjoined, "all hope is useless, and all dreams are but illusions."<sup>9</sup>

The invocations of *tarbiya* in the Evangelical's Treatise and 'Abduh's speech were different in many ways. The first was an unsigned tract published in Beirut by a native Protestant Church abruptly brought into existence by American Protestant missionaries.<sup>10</sup> The other was delivered in front of a hometown crowd by the most famous Muslim reformist of his age. The distance between these invocations hints at the wide terrain covered by the concept of *tarbiya*.

---

<sup>6</sup> *Risala*, 2-3.

<sup>7</sup> *Risala*, 4.

<sup>8</sup> Mohammed 'Abduh. "*Khitab fi-l-Tarbiya*" [A Speech on Upbringing]. In 'Amara, ed. (1991).

<sup>9</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>10</sup> On the abrupt foundation of the Syrian Evangelical Church, see Badr (1992).

On one hand, as the Evangelical's Treatise suggests, the pedagogical thought that grew up around *tarbiya* had a distinctly quietist tone. *Tarbiya* was often invoked as a way to instill order and obedience in children, to train individuals and populations to keep their place, and to safeguard particular visions of social order. At the same time, *tarbiya* emerged as a central mechanism in conversations about communal, individual, and national transformation: as a central instrument of 'Abduh's quest for Muslim unity (*itihad*), for example, or as a practical way to shape an Ottoman, Arab, or Islamic civilization that could compete with Europe's rising political, economic, and military power. How did *tarbiya*, and pedagogical thought more broadly, become a plausible language for expressing quietist concerns about social order as well articulating radical dreams about progress, uplift, and social transformation?

### Three Networks

Three educational networks in Ottoman Lebanon shaped the concept of *tarbiya* that could encompass this broad conceptual terrain. The first revolved around Catholic missionaries, the French government, and Lebanon's Maronite community. Many of the different Catholic institutions and organizations that operated schools in Lebanon were funded by yearly grants from missionary organizations (principally *L'Oeuvre des Écoles d'Orient* and *L'Oeuvre de la Propagation de la Foi*) as well as from the French government.<sup>11</sup> While missionary orders and French diplomats worked through local elites to distribute their money, local elites used their access to new educational spaces to reaffirm a vision of social order in which their family positions and patronage networks were secure.<sup>12</sup> This dovetailing of missionary and elite

---

<sup>11</sup> Although the French government and the Jesuits had "divergent goals and measures for progress" in the nineteenth century, particularly after the coming of the Third Republic in 1870, the Jesuits remained throughout a "useful ally of French interests abroad;" their work in Lebanon served both Jesuit interests and those of the French state. See Falk in Linder et. al., eds. (2016), 166-167.

<sup>12</sup> I use the word "elite" to refer to members of landed, notable families who held tax-farming rights under the Ottomans (*muqata'jis*) and/or served as Ottoman or municipal administrators in Beirut and Mt. Lebanon; I also consider missionary actors to be "elites" in that they often had access to substantial financial capital and property

interests created an arrangement in which elite institutions trained, certified, and socialized the children of the privileged, while primary schools educated non-elite children in basic literacy, obedience, and piety. The twin projects of educating both elite and non-elite children produced a belief in education as a transformative force across a broad swath of Lebanese society, while the institutional structure of education largely strengthened the existing social order.

Elite Catholic education revolved around the Jesuit Ghazir seminary (est. 1843), which became Beirut's *Université Saint Joseph* (USJ) in 1875, and the Lazarist *Collège Saint Joseph - Antoura* (est. 1834). High fees at these institutions ensured that paying students would be drawn from the region's wealthy families.<sup>13</sup> Other students were funded by "scholarships" (*bourses*) from Catholic missionary organizations and the French government that re-inscribed rather than mitigating the elite character of Catholic secondary education.<sup>14</sup> The French earmarked the bourses for the children of the region's elite.<sup>15</sup> Bourses were awarded through a process of consultation that involved both local elites and the French Consulate in Beirut. A parent or recommender would write a letter requesting a bourse for a particular child, specifying the

---

that made them wealthy relative to the vast majority of Lebanon's inhabitants. In the same sense, Lebanese clergy members can also be considered "elites." I also include members of Beirut and Tripoli-based families who made their fortunes as merchants in the 19<sup>th</sup> century.

<sup>13</sup> In 1850, a Ghazir education for lay students cost 1500 kuruş (15 Ottoman lira) per year; by 1872, it was 1800 kuruş plus 250 for "incidentals" (20.5 lira). In 1890, USJ cost 600 francs (26 Ottoman lira) and Antoura 400 (17.32 lira); the native-run Maronite Catholic colleges ran to 250-300 francs (10.83-13 lira). CADN/92/POA/150. Conversions based on Pamuk (2000), 209. Pamuk notes that the value of the gold lira rose in comparison to the silver kuruş or piaster in the 1880s; the lira also increased in value relative to the kuruş with increasing distance from Istanbul. Therefore, these are rough calculations. The lira remained stable against the pound, the dollar, and the franc between 1850 and 1914.

<sup>14</sup> Government *bourses* came later to Ghazir than to Antoura (1861 vs. 1853 or prior), probably due to strained relations between France and the Jesuits under Napoleon III (r. 1848-1870). Ghazir began as a Jesuit clerical seminary and continued to educate priests alongside lay students until it moved its lay operations to Beirut and became USJ in 1875, while Antoura had always focused on educating lay elites. MAE/67/ADP/16 "Secours Religieux."

<sup>15</sup> A note attached to the 1862 list of French subventions to Catholic schools and charitable organizations in the Levant notes that the 80 bourses to Antoura were intended for "les enfants des emirs et de cheikhs." MAE 67 ADP 16, Secours Religieux. Likewise, an 1861 request for bourses for the Jesuit schools written by M. Bentivoglio, the French Consul in Beirut, to the French Minister of Foreign Affairs noted that "it is important that the education of the sons of emirs, cheikhs, and the notables of the land is given by the French, and that the benefits that it reaps make dear the name of France." MAE/67/ADP/16.

preferred college; USJ and Antoura were by far the most often preferred.<sup>16</sup> The Consulate in Beirut would prepare a list of these requests along with recommendations for how the bourses should be allocated. The list and recommendations would then be sent to the Ministry of Foreign Affairs for approval.

Local clerical elites like Archbishop Boustani of Beirut and heads of notable families like the Khazins wrote on behalf of many prospective students. While having a notable or important cleric for a recommender was no guarantee of a bourse, students with a "known" recommender or parent were much more likely to receive one than those whose recommenders were listed as "unknown" (*inconnu*).<sup>17</sup> Thus it is not surprising that in 1880-81, the 16 recipients of bourses (out of 55 total requests) were dominated by the sons of the Maronite elite.<sup>18</sup> These 16 were joined by the students nominated by the French Vice Consul, Maronite notable Assad Karam, and the prominent Daher family. Each recommended three students, who were sometimes (in the case of the Dahers and Karam) their relations, and otherwise likely to be scions of other elite families--in this case, a son of the Frangiés (another Maronite notable family) and the son of one M. Turbey, the headman of Tannourine.<sup>19</sup>

The Catholic colleges were designed to train, socialize, and credential their elite male clientele to maintain their social status in a changing world. The 1877 Prospectus at USJ advertised an education that would "encompass all of the knowledges (*connaissances*) that could open for a young, intelligent man all of the liberal careers, help him access the highest positions,

---

<sup>16</sup> The hierarchy between the two tiers of Catholic colleges is clear both from surveying students' requests and from the amounts given by the French in "subventions" to each one: While a bourse at Antoura, la Sagesse, the Greek Catholic Collège Patriarcat, and USJ was worth 400, 400, 400, and 600 francs respectively, other colleges were worth less (bourses at Aramoun were 240 francs; at St. Jean Maron, 250). Numbers from CADN 92/POA/121; CADN 92PO/A/150; MAE/67/ADP/16.

<sup>17</sup> CADN 92PO/A/122. Folder: Demandes Bourses Accordees 1880-1881.

<sup>18</sup> Alongside the son of the dragoman (translator) for the Italian Consulate, the list included a Khazin, a Shihab, a Tabet, a Shalhoub, a Ghanem, a Ghandour/Trad, a Bellama, and two Dahdahs (the note for Sherfan Dahdah reminded the Consul that his family was "*riche*.")

<sup>19</sup> CADN 92PO/A/122. Folder: Demandes Bourses Accordees 1880-1881.

and acquit himself with honor" on the French baccalaureate exam.<sup>20</sup> Antoura and USJ offered Turkish, Modern Greek, English, German and Italian alongside history, geography, arithmetic, algebra, bookkeeping, and commercial accounting.<sup>21</sup> The acquisition of good character through daily school life and study of the literary arts was linked to future success in white-collar professions like diplomacy, medicine or trade: "the treasures of poetry and eloquence," USJ's prospectus argued, offered "indispensable resources for the study of the sciences, particularly medicine and law."<sup>22</sup> By rhetorically linking "the highest positions" and "all of the liberal careers" to the acquisition of new, teachable skills rather than to inheritance or family name, the programs of the Catholic colleges invited the possibility of a new kind of social mobility, despite the fact that the selection process made that social mobility difficult to access.

Catholic missionaries, Lebanese elites, and the French government also invested in primary education for non-elite children as well as for their own sons.<sup>23</sup> Starting in the 1840s, Jesuit teaching orders joined the Lazarist Filles de la Charité in educating large number of Lebanese students in Catholic primary schools.<sup>24</sup> These orders were funded by local elite families like the Gemayyels, Musallims, and Hobeikas, who offered land, property, and revenues from their *awqaf* (pious foundations).<sup>25</sup> A few fee-paying primary schools in wealthy towns like Beirut and Deir al-Qamar offered a "bourgeois education" in which "French and Arabic

---

<sup>20</sup> ACJV, USJ Prospectus 1877, p. 2.

<sup>21</sup> *Ibid.*, for Antoura's curriculum see CADN 92 PO/A/145. Folder: Diplomas.

<sup>22</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>23</sup> The funds the teaching orders received from Europe were also allocated as "bourses" that mostly went to better-off children; the Lazarists received more funding and thus were able to attract more elite students. Lazarist S. Gélas wrote to Father Supérieur M. Étienne in 1861 that she planned to use her 10,000 francs from the French government that year to "take back the young ladies of the grand families that are now accepting places at the [rival] school of the [Protestant] Prussian deaconesses." *Annales* 1862 p. 500. Letter from S. Gélas to M. Étienne, 23 May 1861; for French data corroborating the amount, see MAE/67/ADP/16, Secours Religieux.

<sup>24</sup> In 1863, the Pauvres Filles du Sacré-Coeur had 2,425 students in the Bekaa, the Mariamettes had 1,180 in Mt. Lebanon, and the Xavieriens had 1,750. *Bulletin des Oeuvres des Ecoles d'Orient*, 1863, p. 213. By 1901-1902, there were a total of 13,195 students in Jesuit primary schools (11,970 of whom were outside of Beirut). ACJV Prat 26. "Écoles de la Mission de Syrie, 1901-1902."

<sup>25</sup> Verdeil (2011); Guillaume (2015).



language, as well as lessons in history, geography, arithmetic, and drawing" were taught.<sup>26</sup>

Elsewhere, however, pedagogy at the primary level centered around obedience, piety, and basic literacy rather than preparation for admission to the colleges. For example, a list of pedagogical directives for the Xavériens, who ran village primary schools for the Jesuits between c. 1862 and 1875, begins with advice about the frequency with which students must take communion and go to confession, alongside suggestions about modesty and decorum (*al-hishma*). The section on "orderliness" (*al-tertib*) began by noting that "all teachers, when they are working with students, should have their hands on a rod."<sup>27</sup>

The combination of the professional credentials and elite socialization offered by Catholic colleges and the broader availability of primary education in Catholic schools inspired hopes that education could serve as a transformative force. Although non-elite boys were unlikely to be admitted to the colleges, they wrote requests showcasing their love for France, Catholicism, and French language and culture. As one student wrote: "as I know that you are the refuge of the poor, and as I have studied this language that is the gift [*le bien*] of the universe, [...] and as I have hope for the beneficence of God and of yourselves, I come to throw myself at your feet that you may accept me at any college you like, and that "*le Grand Seigneur*" may repay you." He signed his letter, Fadlallah Hadcouk "de la nation Catholique."<sup>28</sup> Girls, of course, were not admitted to any of the Catholic colleges until long into the twentieth century—although a few among them would attend top-tier secondary schools run by the American or Prussian Protestants or the Catholic Dames de Nazareth.

---

<sup>26</sup> Verdeil (2007), 213.

<sup>27</sup> "Maitres Xavériens: Directives Pédagogiques." APO [Archive Proche Orient, USJ, Beirut], Xavériens, 9.b.37. Published in Kuri (1985), 332-333.

<sup>28</sup> CADN 92PO/A/122.

Hadcouk may have received a bourse, although I didn't find his name on any lists for subsequent years. It's more likely that he didn't. His letter demonstrates, however, that Catholic secondary education appeared desirable even to non-elites as a pathway a better life, though the pathways were not designed with them in mind. As French-Catholic education served to uphold an existing social order by socializing and credentialing male elites while emphasizing piety and obedience among the *ahali*, it also inspired in some non-elites a *faith* in education, which brought with it a logic of gradual reformism rather than revolution and revolt. That this faith in the transformative power of education validated a system that actually served to reinforce elite privilege might be seen as an example of what Lauren Berlant has called a "cruel optimism," i.e., a moment when something you desire is actually an obstacle to your flourishing.<sup>29</sup>

Beirut's Sunni Muslim elites also established a network of new institutions that projected education as a path to personal and communal transformation while upholding a particular gendered and classed vision of social order. The Ottoman government founded schools in Beirut in the 1850s and 60s and began by the 1880s to implement the 1869 Educational Regulation, which had promised to establish provincial educational councils and a network of new secondary (*idadi*) schools comparable to France's lycées.<sup>30</sup> None of these efforts changed anything at the primary level, however. In 1878, a group of Sunni Muslim merchants and notables in Beirut founded the Maqasid Islamic Benevolent Society (*Jama'iyat al-Maqasid al-Khairiyya al-Islamiyya*) to provide primary education for Beirut's Muslims.<sup>31</sup> By 1880, there were 450 girls

---

<sup>29</sup> Berlant (2011).

<sup>30</sup> The Ottomans founded a military academy (*madrassa 'askariyya*) in Beirut in 1852 and a secondary school (*rushdiyye*) in 1861. See Davie in Hauser et. al., eds. (2016), 79; Fakhoury (2013), 40. On the Educational Regulation, see Somel (2001), 87-88; Tibawi (1966), 257. The *idadis* were to replace the old secondary schools, the *rushdiyyes*, which had been deemed ineffective. The 1869 Regulation also stipulated compulsory school attendance and inspection and better teacher training and pay.

<sup>31</sup> As the Maqasid's 1880 pamphlet, *al-Fajr al-Sadiq* [The True Dawn] remarked, "[the Ottoman schools] do not admit children at the elementary level of education. Thus, if the different communities do not prepare their children

and over 400 boys in Maqasid schools.<sup>32</sup> In 1882, the Maqasid was subsumed into an Ottoman Provincial Educational Council (*ma'arif*) as stipulated by the 1869 Regulation, but Maqasid membership continued to lead educational endeavors in the city, for example working with local notable Ahmed Abbas al-Azhari to establish a *Sultaniyya* school (the highest level of Ottoman education) in 1883, which became Beirut's *idadi* in 1887.<sup>33</sup>

Maqasid schools were free of charge and funded by *awqaf* (pious foundation) revenue and contributions from members and the community.<sup>34</sup> Contributions came not only from the wealthiest but also from middle strata of Beirut society.<sup>35</sup> The students were also likely diverse in terms of class. Some, like 'Aisha Tabbara and Khazindar Bayhum, were children of Maqasid members and belonged to Beirut's wealthy merchant and notable families.<sup>36</sup> The rapid growth of Maqasid schools--to 800 students in the first four years--suggests that students came from outside the upper class. What was taught, how, and to whom, however, was dominated by the Maqasid membership, which was drawn from Beirut's Sunni Muslim elite.<sup>37</sup>

---

for admission, they would be deprived of their benefits." *al-Fajr al-Sadiq* [*The True Dawn*] (Dar al-Makasid: Beirut, 1984), 12.

<sup>32</sup> *al-Fajr al-Sadiq*, 16-17; another contemporary estimate put the total number of students at 748 (untitled announcement, *Thamarat al-Funun*, 24 Nov/6 Dec 1880, Issue 308, p. 1).

<sup>33</sup> "Alan min Majlis al-Baladiyya Bayrut." *Thamarat al-Funun*, 22 August/4 September 1877, p 3.

<sup>34</sup> Ayyoubi (1966), 63. These costs were not insignificant: the first year's running costs for the two girls' schools came to 14,281.10 kuruş (142.8 Ottoman lira) and 6,586.20 kuruş (65.86 lira); the boys' school cost 720.25 kuruş (7.2 lira). See *al-Fajr al-Sadiq*, Year Four, reprinted in Shebaru (2001), 425. In its first year, the Society's total revenue from contributions and *awqaf* came to 135,152.20 kuruş (1,351.5 lira), a significant sum in a region where 2.5 kilograms of tomatoes cost 3.5 kuruş. See *al-Fajr al-Sadiq*, Year Four. Price of tomatoes from Bkirké Archives, General Budget, *Rumiyya* School, 1902.

<sup>35</sup> Contributions in the first four years ranged from the relatively modest 20 kuruş given by Ahmed Efendi al-Qabbani, to the 450 kuruş donated by the Bayhum family. See *al-Fajr al-Sadiq* Year 4. For list of contributions, see Shebaru, pp. 408-425.

<sup>36</sup> Shebaru, 35.

<sup>37</sup> A list of the 25 members in 1878 included well-known wealthy Sunnis like Bashir al-Barbir, Hussein Bayhum, Hadar al-Hoss, Raghib 'Azz al-Din, Sa'id al-Jundi, Sa'id Tabbara, Taha Nsouli, 'Abd al-Qadir Sinno, 'Abd al-Latif Hamada, and many others. The Bayhums, for example, were a branch of the 'Agharr family, who had been substantial landholders starting in the eighteenth century and held positions in the consultative council (*majlis al-shura*) established by Ibrahim Pasha in the 1830s. The Barbirs rose through the sugar trade with Europe and were able to invest substantial resources in Beirut real estate after about 1850. On the Barbirs, see Fakhoury (2013), 64. Eight out the first 25 members would go on to serve as members of Beirut's municipal council (est. 1882), which represented the top 1% of Beirut society in financial terms (see Hanssen in Philipp and Schumann (2004), 70, 150).

The Maqasid primary schools constituted the lower end of a hierarchical network in which the *Sultaniyya*, like the Catholic colleges of Antoura and USJ, trained male students for careers in bureaucracy, trade, or diplomacy and produced practitioners of the new sciences who could go on to medical school in Cairo or Istanbul.<sup>38</sup> The Beirut *Sultaniyya* curriculum included French (*francızca*), arithmetic (*hesap*), and writing in Turkish and Arabic alongside the study of the Quran, the art of recitation (*tajweed*), and ethics (*ahlaq*) for Muslim students in Year 1. Geography, english, algebra (*cebiri*), chemistry (*kimya*), natural philosophy (*hükümet-i tabiiya*), natural history (*tarih-i tabii*), and engineering (*handese*) were for the upper years.<sup>39</sup> By marrying the new arts and sciences with the study of Islamic ethics and Qu'ranic recitation, the Ottoman curriculum emphasized its links with its Muslim population and drew on aspects of a traditional Islamic education to create a cadre of male Ottoman business and statesmen prepared for a new age but still deeply loyal to the state.<sup>40</sup>

Top-tier Ottoman schools in Beirut, as elsewhere, probably permitted limited social mobility for boys, allowing a few exceptional students to join elites on the path to lucrative administrative, medical, or business careers.<sup>41</sup> The relatively capacious primary curriculum at Maqasid schools would have prepared some male students to attend the *Sultaniyya* or other top-tier secondary institutions.<sup>42</sup> Istanbul certainly appears to have made broad promises to open top-

---

Service on the municipal council was not well-paid and the ability to stand for election was based on the payment of a property tax, which meant that "only notables whose residence was worth at least 50,000 piastres were eligible candidates." Hanssen (2004), 63-64. Fakhoury describes the founders of the Maqasid as "shaykhs, ulema, and merchants (*tujjar*)," Fakhoury (2013), 16. Also see Shebaru (2001), Somel (2001). This elite character persisted into the twentieth century: after the Maqasid was re-established in 1908, it was dominated by two well-known wealthy merchant families, the Salams and the Daouqs. See Johnson (1986).

<sup>38</sup> The *Sultaniyya* would be joined by another elite college, the Kulliyya 'Uthmaniyya, in 1895.

<sup>39</sup> BoA YA RES 00021\_00027\_001\_001 (1300/1882)

<sup>40</sup> Somel (2001), Fortna (2002).

<sup>41</sup> On limited social mobility in Ottoman schools elsewhere in the empire, see Somel (2001), Denguilhem in Philipp and Schaebler (1998), Rogan in Philipp and Schumann (2004), Fortna (2002).

<sup>42</sup> Maqasid schools taught basic reading, the study of Qu'ran, Islamic principles and the unity of God (*'aqa'id wa tawhid*), writing, and arithmetic, as well as the tools of Arabic rhetoric (*al-sarf wa-l-nahu*) and ethical cultivation and comportment (*tahdib al-ahlaq wa adab*); for girls, they also offered sewing (*fann al-khiyata*) and embroidery

tier education to all deserving boys.<sup>43</sup> The *Sultaniyya's* tuition, however, was substantial: in 1883, it cost 8 Ottoman lira per year, plus 15 lira for room and board.<sup>44</sup> Paying students, then, would have hailed from the region's elite.<sup>45</sup> Girls who graduated from the Maqasid schools could attend the old-style girls' *rushdiyye* in Beirut (est. c. 1894), where half the students were on scholarship, or prestigious Protestant or Catholic girls' schools.<sup>46</sup>

Not unlike the French-Catholic network, then, Beirut's Sunni Muslim elite worked with Ottoman officials to influence curricula and pedagogy for both elites and non-elites. While the sons of elite families (and perhaps a few scholarship students) attended the *Sultaniyya*, for most, formal education stopped after primary school. In the end, this elite-driven educational network allowed education to appear as a means to personal and communal transformation, while it mostly served to ensure that elite sons could maintain their families' wealth and social position. The limited social mobility of the Sunni-Ottoman model may, in fact, have intensified the "cruel optimism" of Lebanese education: as exceptional non-elite students progressed into the higher tiers, they proved that education *could* serve as a tool for individual and communal transformation, even if for most, it would not to do so.

---

(*tetritz*). See Fakhoury (2008), 57; Yazbek (1955), 142. Some elite Muslim girls might have gone on to attend Protestant schools run by the Prussian Deaconesses or the American Protestants, this practice remained rare until non-sectarian girls schools like the Ahliyya school run by Mary Kassab opened after World War I. See Sbaiti (2006).

<sup>43</sup> According to *Thamarat al-Funun*, the *Sultaniyya* promised to "welcome students for free from all the classes (*sunuf*) of the people (*ahali*)," agreeing to "accept for free those who completed their primary education in the elementary (*ibtida'i*) schools and secondary (*rushdiyye*) schools and who excelled at their studies and in their morals." Qabbani [?], "*al-Ma'arif*." *Thamarat al-Funun* 24 Feb/10 March 1890, Issue 774, p. 2. This accords with the spirit of the Educational Regulation of 1869, which, as Fortna describes, "envisioned a complete, integrated network of schools that would stretch across the length and breadth of the empire and would work as a pyramid to funnel the top students to the capital for specialized training at the advanced level or directly into the scribal service of the central government." See Fortna (2002), 113.

<sup>44</sup> Hanssen (2005), 175. Tuition rose to 12 Ottoman lira (1200 kuruş) by 1907; see Hanssen (2005), 146.

<sup>45</sup> In 1883, the school registered 55 students, many of whom came from important families from around the region: seven came from the Jerusalem-based Husayni family alone, for example, while others hailed from Beirut notable families, whether Muslim, Druze, or Christian, or were sons and grandsons of Ottoman officials. See Hanssen (2005), 174. Anderson (2009) concurs that the school educated the sons of the region's elite.

<sup>46</sup> A girls' boarding school, or *inas rushdiyye*, is mentioned in the Ottoman yearbook (*Salname*) for 1311-1312 (1894).

American Protestants joined their Sunni/Ottoman and French/Maronite colleagues as educational leaders in nineteenth-century Lebanon. Lacking a sympathetic local elite to help them establish themselves and shape school-building efforts to their own purposes, the Protestant network offered a relatively large degree of social mobility between primary and secondary educational institutions. Their flagship institution, the Syrian Protestant College (est. 1865), educated and credentialled both elites and boys from poor backgrounds to become doctors, lawyers, and journalists.<sup>47</sup> At the same time, however, the Protestant educational network upheld a particular vision of social order based on firm hierarchies between urban and rural, local and missionary, and men and women.

Like the Catholic collèges and the Beirut *Sultaniyya*, the SPC was a training ground for the skills demanded by professions like medicine, administration, and trade. According to an early prospectus, the college sought to "enable native youth to obtain *in this country* the literary, scientific and professional education which the exigencies of the community demand."<sup>48</sup> The curriculum was arranged accordingly. To compete with French-speaking USJ and Antoura and respond to local demand, the SPC changed its language of instruction from Arabic to English in 1879-1880.<sup>49</sup> By 1889, students in the preparatory department took English, French, Arithmetic, Mathematics, Bible, History, and Geography; at the collegiate level, Anatomy, Chemistry, Zoology, Astrology, Botany, Geology, Moral Philosophy, and Psychology and Logic were also offered. The medical department oversaw a four-year undergraduate curriculum that included

---

<sup>47</sup> The SPC was renamed the American University of Beirut in 1920.

<sup>48</sup> AUB Archives, 1.6.2 MSS AUB 28 Box 1: SPC Memorabilia, 1861-1901. "Programme and Prospectus of the Native Protestant College Institute of Beirut, Syria" [n.d., probably 1861-62], p. 1. Emphasis in original.

<sup>49</sup> Womack (2012), 9; Tibawi (1966), 207. The medical school made the shift in 1882-83.

Anatomy, Practice of Medicine, Surgery, Hygiene, Geology, Zoology, and Minerology as well as a two-year course in Pharmacy.<sup>50</sup>

Protestant schools were open to children from many backgrounds and sometimes served as conduits for non-elite boys to access the SPC.<sup>51</sup> Boys like Jabr Dumit, Daud Kurban, and Jirjis Khuri al-Makdisi, none of whom came from Lebanon's established elite families, attended Protestant schools in Safita, Marja'youn, and Tripoli. Once identified as "promising" or "bright" by missionaries like Samuel Jessup (in the case of Makdisi) or Lebanese Protestants like Butrus al-Bustani (in the case of Dumit), they entered the SPC's Collegiate department by way of the Abeih Seminary or the SPC's own preparatory school.<sup>52</sup> However, a distinct hierarchy emerged between urban and rural schools: students educated in the urban centers of Beirut, Tripoli, Zahle, and Sidon were far more likely to make it to the SPC.<sup>53</sup> Meanwhile, "most of the pupils in rural schools were bound to revert to illiteracy after leaving the school and becoming part of their environment."<sup>54</sup>

Although tuition was comparable to other elite colleges, the SPC made concrete efforts to open its doors to non-elite boys.<sup>55</sup> The 1861 prospectus included stipulations regarding "scholarships for indigent students," noting that "in a land where most of the population are poor—and Protestants especially, sometimes for the very fact of having left their old faith, are generally unable to do much for the support of their sons at the college—unusual efforts are

---

<sup>50</sup> AUB Catalogue 1889-1890, AUB Archives, accessed online 8.10.2016.

<sup>51</sup> They also allowed non-elite girls to access the top-tier secondary institutions, the Beirut Female Seminary and the Tripoli School for Girls, which were among the most prestigious girls' schools in Lebanon and offered curricula similar to the SPC's preparatory department, including foreign languages as well as scientific subjects like hygiene and astronomy.

<sup>52</sup> Abunassr (2013), 138-149.

<sup>53</sup> In the words of American missionary Henry Jessup, these schools—and not their rural counterparts—were the true "rills that fed the college river." Tibawi (1966), 285.

<sup>54</sup> Tibawi (1966), 240.

<sup>55</sup> In 1880, tuition was 17 Ottoman lira (1700 kuruş) per annum for preparatory and collegiate students and 22 Ottoman lira (2200 kuruş) for medical and pharmacy. Medical and Pharmacy students coming from the SPC's collegiate department paid 17 Ottoman lira. Numbers are assuming the lowest level of "boarding" privileges, which cost 12 lira, rather than the higher level which cost 25 lira. SPC Catalogue 1880-81, AUB Archives.

necessary to encourage promising young men to undertake a thorough course of study."<sup>56</sup> The college pledged to arrange teaching jobs, lab work, or "other forms of labor" for "poor and deserving students."<sup>57</sup> These work-study scholarships were available until 1882 and probably much longer.<sup>58</sup> Attempts to make the SPC accessible to non-elites worked, at least for some: the yearly lists of SPC graduates included children from non-elite as well as elite backgrounds.<sup>59</sup>

While the SPC offered a relatively substantial degree of social mobility, it upheld a social order in which elites were still demarcated from non-elites and lines between Lebanese and Americans and between men and women were strictly maintained. As the 1884-85 catalogue shows, "general boarders" could pay 12 lira for shared sleeping accomodation and local food in the regular dining room, while wealthy students could get 1/3 of a sleeping room and eat European food at a special table in the dining room for 25 lira. Students willing to pay 50 pounds Sterling (55 lira) could occupy a private room, access fuel, lights and washing facilities, and eat European food at a private table.<sup>60</sup> Daily life at the SPC was also shaped by a racial heirarchy based on a longstanding Protestant desire to keep the "native" native.<sup>61</sup> Teachers at the SPC were

---

<sup>56</sup> AUB Archives, 1.6.2 MSS AUB 28 Box 1: SPC Memorabilia, 1861-1901. "Programme and Prospectus of the Native Protestant College Institute of Beirut, Syria" [n.d., probably 1861-62], p. 14.

<sup>57</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>58</sup> These scholarships are mentioned in an 1874 pamphlet entitled "The Syrian Protestant College" as well as in an 1882 fundraising letter from Henry Jessup asking for contributions to match a 10,000\$ gift to the scholarship fund, suggesting the system lasted some years. See "The Syrian Protestant College," AUB Archives 1.6.2 MSS AUB 28 Box 1: SPC SPC 1861-1901; Henry Jessup, "Scholarship Endowment Fund for the Syrian Protestant College," AUB Archives 1.6.2 MSS AUB 28 Box 3: SPC Memorabilia.

<sup>59</sup> In 1880-81, for example, the undergraduate students included sons of elite families like the Tabits and the Shihabs alongside students like Jurji Zeidan, the son of a restaurant-owner who lived in a one-room house in downtown Beirut, and his friend Jabr Dumit, who was raised by a single mother in Safita, north of Tripoli. SPC Catalogue 1880-81. On Zeidan, see Zeidan (1990). On Dumit, see Abunassr (2013), 139-141. It is also important to note that branches of large Lebanese families may have differed in terms of wealth, and some may even have converted to Protestantism by the 1880s. Thus the names can only be a rough estimate.

<sup>60</sup> *SPC Catalogue, 1884-85*, pp. 7-8. Quoted in Scholz (1997), 139.

<sup>61</sup> This idea had been a hallmark of Protestant education since the early 1830s. ABCFM Corresponding Secretary Rufus Anderson himself had expressed concerns that Protestant educational projects would denaturalize the Lebanese, imbuing them with customs, habits and desires that would direct them away from the work of converting their bretheren. Fleischmann (2005), 275. The division between native and missionary was not merely of instrumental value: it also represented what Makdisi has called "a mid-century American racialist reading of the world." Makdisi (2009), 209.



paid far less if they were "native" than if they were American, regardless of their level of education, and native teachers were never promoted to full professor.<sup>62</sup>

Like their Muslim and Catholic contemporaries, too, the Protestant educational network was structured around a hierarchical separation of genders. Both native Lebanese and American women were systematically subordinated to their male peers and paid less than their male contemporaries.<sup>63</sup> Gender segregation among students was enforced above the primary level, and girls were not admitted to the college until 1920.<sup>64</sup> They could, however, learn science, foreign languages, and the domestic arts at the Beirut Female Seminary and Tripoli Girls' School. While girls' education was designed to produce educated mothers, it also, perhaps unintentionally, produced a generation of women writers who became theorists of *tarbiya* in the decades to come.<sup>65</sup>

This paper has argued that transformations in the political economy of pedagogy in nineteenth-century Lebanon produced a new concept of *tarbiya* that could express both dreams for individual and communal transformation as well as desires to stabilize hierarchical social orders. The breadth and plasticity of pedagogical thought in Ottoman Lebanon would lay the ground for *tarbiya* to become a key concept for Arab intellectuals at the turn of the century and

---

<sup>62</sup> Scholz (1997), 312. Native teachers made between 49% and 63% of the salary of Americans in the same positions Scholz (1997), 326-28. This ongoing discrimination may have been part of the reason Yacoub Sarruf and Fares Nimr, two of the College's distinguished graduates and founders of the famous scientific-literary digest, *al-Muqtataf*, left the college in 1882, on top of the debate about Darwin that roiled the campus in that year. See Scholz, 315-318, Elshakry (2007), 211. The divide between native and non-native teachers also reached down to the primary and secondary levels: in Tripoli in 1882, for example, the Mission spent \$1,282.25 in one month on the room and board of the headmistress of the Tripoli Girls' School, Harriet LaGrange, compared to just \$481 per month to pay Jabr Dumit (mentioned above) for his services as a teacher. His was a relatively high salary, too: the 1882 books also list several entries for "assistant teacher" at \$100, per month or longer. NEST Archives, Day Book of Tripoli Station, 1882 (See March and October).

<sup>63</sup> Fleischmann (2006), 268. Lindner (2011), 185.

<sup>64</sup> NEST archives, "List of Schools, Teachers, and Diplomas, 1889-1893." Some village schools, like Duma, Barbara, Baaklin, and Suq al-Gharb, are listed once with no specification as to gender of students, suggesting that the school may have taught both boys and girls. Larger villages like Beino and Safita, as well as the urban centers of Beirut, Tripoli, Deir al-Kamar, and Sidon, list both boys' and girls' schools.

<sup>65</sup> Fleischmann (2006).

beyond.

## Works Cited

### Published Works

- ‘Abduh, Mohammed. "Khitab fi-l-Tarbiya" [A Speech on Upbringing], in *al-A‘māl al-Kāmila* [The Complete Works] Part III, ed. Mohammed ‘Amara. Cairo: Dar al Shuruq, 1991.
- Abunnasr, Maria B. "The Making of Ras Beirut: A Landscape of Memory for Narratives of Exceptionalism, 1870-1975." Ph.D. diss., University of Massachusetts Amherst, 2013.
- Anderson, Betty S. *The American University of Beirut: Arab Nationalism and Liberal Education*. Austin: University of Texas Press, 2009.
- Ayyoubi, Jamila. "Jama‘iyyat al-Maqasid al-Khairiyya al-Islamiyya fi Beirut." MA Thesis, American University of Beirut, 1966.
- Badr, Habib. "Missions to ‘Nominal Christians’: The Policy and Practice of the American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions and Its Missionaries Concerning Eastern Churches Which Led to the Organization of a Protestant Church in Beirut (1819-1848)." Princeton Theological Seminary, 1992.
- Berlant, Lauren Gail. *Cruel Optimism*. Durham: Duke University Press, 2011.
- Denguilhem, Randi. "State Civil Education in Late Ottoman Damascus: A Unifying or Separating Force?" In *The Syrian Land: Processes of Integration and Fragmentation, Bilad Al Sham from the 18th to 20th Centuries*. Philipp and Schaebler, eds. Stuttgart: Steiner, 1998.
- El Shakry, Omnia. "Schooled Mothers and Structured Play: Child Rearing in Turn-of-the-Century Egypt," in *Remaking Women: Feminism and Modernity in the Middle East*, ed. Lila Abu Lughod. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1998. 126-171.
- Elshakry, Marwa. *Reading Darwin in Arabic, 1860-1950*. Chicago: University Of Chicago Press, 2014.
- Fakhoury, Abdellatif. *Nur al-Fajr al-Sadiq: Mu'assissat Jama‘iyyat al-Khairiyya al-Islamiyya fi Beyrut, 1295/1878* [The Light of the True Dawn: The Maqasid Islamic Benevolent Society of Beirut, 1295/1878]. Beirut: Dar al-Maqasid, 2013.
- Mohammed ‘Abdallah Bayhum: al-Sarikh al-Maktum*. Bayrut: Dar al-Hadatha lil Tiba‘ wa-l-Nashr wa-l-Tawzia‘, 2008.
- Fortna, Benjamin C. *Imperial Classroom: Islam, the State, and Education in the Late Ottoman Empire*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2002.

- Fleischmann, Ellen. "Evangelization or Education: American Protestant Missionaries, the American Board, and the Girls and Women of Syria (1830-1910)." In *New Faith in Ancient Lands: Western Missions in the Middle East in the Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries*. Heleen Van Der Murre, ed. Leiden: Brill, 2006.
- Forum: Global Liberalisms. Glenda Sluga and Timothy Rowse, eds. *Modern Intellectual History*, 12 (Nov 2015).
- Guillaume, Claire. "La congrégation des soeurs des saints-coeurs de jésus et de marie au mont-liban dans la deuxième moitié du XIX siècle: des institutrices arabes au service de la mission jésuite." MA Thesis, Université Paris-Sorbonne, 2015.
- Hanssen, Jens. *Fin de Siècle Beirut: The Making of an Ottoman Provincial Capital*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2005.
- "From Social Status to Intellectual Activity: Some Protopographical Observations on the Municipal Council in Beirut, 1868-1908," in Philipp and Schumann, eds, *From the Syrian Land to the States of Syria and Lebanon*. Würzburg: Ergon Verlag in Kommission, 2004.
- Hauser, Julia, Christine B Lindner, and Esther Möller, eds.. *Entangled Education: Foreign and Local Schools in Ottoman Syria and Mandate Lebanon*. Beirut, Würzburg: Ergon Verlag in Kommission, 2016.
- Jama'iyyat al-Maqasid al-Khairiyya al-Islamiyya fi Bayrut. *al-Fajr al-Sadiq [The True Dawn]* (pub. in Arabic, French and English). Bayrut: Dar al-Makasid, 1984.
- Johnson, Michael. *Class & Client in Beirut: The Sunni Muslim Community and the Lebanese State, 1840-1985*. Atlantic Highlands, NJ: Ithaca Press, 1986.
- Khuri-Makdisi, Ilham. *The Eastern Mediterranean and the Making of Global Radicalism, 1860-1914*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2010.
- Kuri, Sami. *Une Histoire du Liban à travers les archives des jésuites*. Beyrouth: Dar el-Machreq, 1985.
- Lindner, Christine Beth. "Negotiating the Field: American Protestant Missionaries in Ottoman Syria, 1823 to 1860." Ph.D. diss., University of Edinburgh (United Kingdom), 2009.
- Pamuk, Şevket. *A Monetary History of the Ottoman Empire [Electronic Resource]*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2000.
- Sartori, Andrew. *Bengal in Global Concept History: Culturalism in the Age of Capital*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2008.

- Sbaiti, Nadya Jeanne. "Lessons in History: Education and the Formation of National Society in Beirut, Lebanon, 1920-1960s." Ph.D., Georgetown University, 2008.
- Scholz, Norbert. "Foreign Education and Indigenous Reaction in Late Ottoman Lebanon: Students and Teachers at the SPC in Beirut." Georgetown University, 1997.
- Shebaru, 'Assam. *Jama'iyat al-Maqasid al-Khairiyya al-Islamiyya fi Beirut, 1290-1321 [1878-2000]*. Bayrut: Dar Musbah al-Fikr, 2001.
- Somel, Selçuk Akşin. *The Modernization of Public Education in the Ottoman Empire, 1839-1908: Islamization, Autocracy, and Discipline*. Boston: Brill, 2001.
- Syrian Evangelical Church, *Risala fi Tarbiyat al-Adfal* [Treatise on the Upbringing of Children]. Beirut: al-Matba'a al-Amrikiyya, 1850.
- Tibawi, Abdul Latif. *American Interests in Syria, 1800-1901: A Study of Educational, Literary and Religious Work*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1966.
- Verdeil, Chantal. *La mission jésuite du Mont-Liban et de Syrie: 1830-1864*. Paris: les Indes savantes, 2011.
- "Un établissement catholique dans la société pluriconfessionnelle de la fin de l'Empire ottoman." *Cahiers de la Méditerranée*, no. 75 (December 10, 2007): 28–38.
- "La Classe «Sous Le Chêne» et Le Pensionnat." *Outre-Mers* 94, no. 354–355 (2007): 197–221.
- Yazbek, Yusuf Ibrahim. *Awraq Lubnaniyya: Majella Shahriyya Tu'na bi Tarikh Lubnan*. Vol. 1: 1955.
- Zaidan, Jirji, and Thomas Philipp. *The Autobiography of Jurji Zaidan: Including Four Letters to His Son*. Washington, D.C.: Three Continents Press, 1990.

## Archives

- AUB Archives of the American University of Beirut (Nami Jafet Library, Beirut, Lebanon)
- BA Archives of the Maronite Patriarchate (Bkirké, Lebanon)
- NEST Near East School of Theology (Beirut, Lebanon)
- ACJV Archives de la Compagnie de Jésus, Vanves (Paris, France)
- ACJL Archives de la Compagnie de Jésus, Liban (Université de Saint Joseph, Beirut)

MAE	Ministère des Affaires Étrangères, La Corneuve (Paris, France)
CADN	Centre des Archives Diplomatiques Nationales (Nantes, France)
BoA	Başbakanlık Arşivi (Ottoman Prime Ministry Archives, Istanbul, Turkey)

### **Journals and Periodicals**

*Annales de la Congrégation de la Mission de St. Vincent de Paul*  
(accessed at the Antoura collège archive, Lebanon)

*Bulletin des Oeuvres des Ecoles d'Orient*  
(accessed at the Bibilothèque National de France, Paris)

*Thamarat al-Funun*  
(accessed via microform at AUB and in hard copy at the Maqasid library, Beirut)

*Ottoman Salname 1311-1312 (1894)*  
(accessed via the Ataturk Kitaplığı, Istanbul, Turkey)